



Scottish Government
Riaghaltas na h-Alba
gov.scot

A FAIRER SCOTLAND FOR WOMEN: Gender Pay Gap Action Plan



Contents

Ministerial Foreword	4
Objective	6
Introduction	9
1. Leadership	15
2. Employment	17
3. Early Learning and Childcare	27
4. Schools	31
5. Post School and Skills Training	36
6. Employability	40
7. Social Security	42
8. Economic Development	44
Annex A - References	47
Annex B - Working Group Members	60



Jamie Hepburn,
Minister for Business, Fair Work and Skills



Ministerial FOREWORD

All of us benefit when women can participate equally in our economy. Supporting and empowering women and girls to reach their full potential is at the heart of our sustainable and inclusive economic growth ambitions. This approach supports the World Bank's view that women's equality in the labour market is a key driver of growth that works for everyone.

Our First Minister stated, upon her appointment, her hope that it would *"open the gate to greater opportunity for all women and send a strong, positive message to girls and young women, indeed to all women, across our land - there should be no limit to your ambition for what you can achieve. If you are good enough and if you work hard enough, the sky is the limit and no glass ceiling should ever stop you from achieving your dreams."*

We are therefore committed to reducing the gender pay gap by the end of this parliamentary term and to tackle the labour market inequalities faced by women, particularly disabled women, minority ethnic women, women from poorer socio economic backgrounds and women with caring responsibilities.

We are making progress. Our young women are achieving high levels of attainment at school and higher education. The gender employment gap, inactivity and unemployment rates for women have decreased and our full time gender pay gap is lower than the rest of the UK as a whole.

Despite these positive trends, we know that we need to do more. It is clear that there is an appetite in Scotland for immediate action to step up the pace of change. Given Scotland's changing demographics and the need to attract and retain the most talented workforce, closing the gender pay gap makes good economic sense. It also makes a statement about the kind of Scotland we all seek - an inclusive, fair, prosperous, innovative country, ready and willing to embrace the future.

Gender inequalities in the workplace reflect a complex web of issues related to ethnicity, ability and socio-economic identities as well as incidents of discrimination. Women's choices, their opportunities, their age, education, skills, household characteristics, caring responsibilities, access to childcare and more, all need to be considered.

It is because of this that we are taking a whole systems approach: closing the gender pay gap in Scotland will require collective action, political will, and using a broad range of levers including legislation and gender budgeting. This Action Plan responds to that challenge, building upon many existing Scottish Government

strategies, and setting out a number of ambitious yet achievable actions. The aim is to tackle the gender pay gap from all possible angles, rather than singling out only one factor or cause. These activities will mutually reinforce each other.

The Action Plan highlights the early and sustained action we and our partners will be taking throughout a young girl's life to break down gender stereotyping. Stereotyping which can eventually lead to occupational segregation is one of the main drivers of the gender pay gap. The Plan also demonstrates our continued determination to tackle discrimination and sexual harassment across all learning and workplace settings.

This Plan is not just about supporting girls and women to participate equally in our labour market. It is also about promoting and installing fair work principles and the benefits these can bring to all individuals, employers and the Scottish economy. It sets out how we can break down barriers which currently constrain individual's and household choices.

Tackling the gender pay gap is also key for tackling child poverty, another Scottish Government priority. Poverty and gender are closely linked, with women facing a range of barriers to paid employment and progression, also taking on most of the paid and unpaid caring roles in households. In recognition

of this, our Tackling Child Poverty Delivery Plan included many interventions directly targeted at alleviating women's poverty; this action plan develops and deepens some of those interventions.

I have spelled out what steps policy makers will take to ensure that we do not unintentionally reinforce causes of the gender pay gap in our cross- government policies.

While some of the tools we require to adequately address the gender pay gap such as employment and social security laws remain under the control of the UK Parliament, we will continue to press for additional devolved employment powers to provide the Scottish Parliament with the ability to strengthen employment rights that work for Scotland. In the meantime, we will also call on the UK Government to improve or develop policies that can help tackle gender inequalities.

I also urge employers to take real measurable action to address the causes of the pay gap within their businesses. I am committed to working with employers to ensure that we can all learn from the good practice which is taking place within the workplace to eliminate discriminatory practices including sexual harassment and abuse.

We will not tackle all of the drivers of the gender pay gap with short-term fixes and I recognise that

not all of our actions will have an immediate effect on reducing the headline gender pay gap statistics but they will lay the foundations for a serious, committed and long-term approach to achieving our aspiration of closing the gender pay gap in Scotland within a generation.

Indeed, I am clear that we all have a duty to support the next generation of young people who will be entering the labour market to reach their full potential and to have a world-leading working life where fair work drives success, wellbeing and prosperity for individuals, businesses, organisations and for society by 2025, as outlined in the Fair Work Framework.

This Action Plan is not only the Scottish Government's first in setting out how we plan to tackle the causes of the gender pay gap but it also marks an historic landmark in the long march to gender equality.

Last year we celebrated the centenary of the first women being enfranchised to vote. However, in recognising that anniversary we must also acknowledge that this was only the beginning of the process of equal voting rights for women and not the end. So too must we recognise that the reduction in the gender pay gap in Scotland has not yet achieved equality in pay in Scotland. Only by our continued efforts through this action plan will we achieve this outcome.



OBJECTIVE

To continue to reduce the gender pay gap for employees in Scotland by the end of this parliamentary term (May 2021) and to tackle the labour market inequalities faced by women, particularly disabled women, older women, minority ethnic women, women from poorer socio economic backgrounds and women with caring responsibilities. To maintain, our position relative to the UK as a whole and improve our position relative to our international neighbours.

In line with our Fair Work Action Plan¹, we want workers in Scotland to have a world-leading working life where fair work drives success, wellbeing and prosperity for individuals, businesses, organisations and for society by 2025.

Purpose

To help create a fairer and more successful country, with opportunities for all of Scotland to flourish through sustainable and inclusive economic growth (National Performance Framework).

Driving Change

As outlined in our action plan, we intend to drive this change through taking action across the range of Scottish Government policy responsibilities working together with: local government; public bodies, trade unions, enterprise and skills agencies, businesses, voluntary organisations and people living in Scotland.

¹ <https://economicactionplan.mygov.scot/fair-work>



Our actions include:

- Promoting gender equality within early learning, schools, colleges, universities, employability programmes, the labour market, businesses, and social security.
- Driving both more immediate and long-term change including addressing gender stereotyping, sexual harassment, and other labour market and care inequalities.
- Encouraging and supporting employers to tackle the causes of the gender pay gap within their own organisations.
- Developing data on gender equality through the Gender Index and improving the intersectional data available to inform policy across national and local government.

National Outcomes

The Gender Pay Gap Action Plan will help to deliver the national outcomes set out in the National performance Framework. The outcomes:

- We have thriving and innovative businesses with quality jobs and fair work for everyone
- We are well educated, skilled and able to contribute to society
- We respect, protect and fulfil human rights and live free from discrimination
- We tackle poverty by sharing opportunities, wealth and power more equally



- We grow up loved, safe and respected so that we realise our full potential
- We have a globally competitive, entrepreneurial, inclusive and sustainable economy

These outcomes:

- reflect the values and aspirations of the people of Scotland;
- help to track progress in reducing inequality; and
- are aligned with the following United Nations Sustainable Development Goals

Overarching Strategies

Labour Market Strategy
Scotland's Economic Strategy

Aligned Plans/ Programmes

Tackling the causes of the gender pay gap requires cross-government action, which is why this Action Plan is closely aligned to a number of other plans that are highlighted in Annex A.





INTRODUCTION

As an open economy, trading with the world, Scotland faces into many of the same significant labour market challenges being experienced across the world. These are likely to continue and indeed accelerate in the years ahead. New and emerging technologies are revolutionising how we are able to engage with work and are likely to fundamentally change many of the jobs we currently do. Allied to this, societal changes mean that Scotland is becoming a more diverse and equal society with a growing thirst for fairness.

While we cannot fully predict what the labour market of the future will look like, we do know that Scotland has huge economic potential. We are well placed to take advantage of the economic opportunities that come from our established strengths in innovation and technological change. Our Economic Strategy sets out our vision for sustainable and inclusive growth. Growth that boosts competitiveness

while tackling inequalities and delivers for our communities, for the environment, for workers and business. We have an opportunity to take decisive action to release the economic potential of those groups who have traditionally experienced economic inequalities. This will also have an important impact on our commitment to end child poverty.

One of the biggest and most persistent labour

market inequalities we face relates to women. Women consistently experience a range of damaging labour market disadvantages. The main indicator for this is the overall gender pay gap which currently sits at 15 per cent. While most countries have a gender pay gap, the Scottish Government is determined to move beyond narrow and outmoded thinking about the inevitability of the situation and to close

Scotland's pay gap. This action plan is part of a range of labour market action plans designed to lay out meaningful steps to address inequality in the labour market.

To systematically identify short, medium and long term actions that relate to key stages in a woman's life, the Scottish Government has worked with a wide range of stakeholders. This action plan should be regarded as a starting point to a long-term commitment to address the challenges women face in the labour market as a central element of our approach to achieving inclusive economic growth.

It is well understood that equality for women and the gender pay gap are not solely economic issues. However we are looking to ensure that we mainstream these issues within economic policy as well as in those areas of

social policy where they have more traditionally resided. We are doing this for two reasons. First, it is unacceptable that in the 21st century women are still disadvantaged in the labour market. Second, our economic potential as a country cannot be fully realised if we do not draw effectively on the talents of women and share the benefits of success more fairly across the genders. This makes good business sense as well as being a fundamental part of a civilised modern society.

The gender pay gap is a challenging issue with no single solution. Many of our conclusions land on issues that have been well understood for decades, but with limited and slow progress in dealing with them. We acknowledge that societal attitudes help shape some of the factors leading to women's labour market contribution being under-utilised and

under-valued. Our thinking about the economy and its development has not traditionally focused on addressing the structural inequality which women continue to experience. Importantly, we also identify the impact sexual harassment and violence against women can have on women's full economic participation.

While these conclusions should cause us all to feel uncomfortable and angry, we must channel that emotional energy into taking decisive and co-ordinated action. This action plan is a start to that process. We hope it will begin a long-term, sustained movement involving women, men, employers, trade unions, schools, colleges, universities, public bodies and all levels of government to tackle head on the causes of the gender pay gap in Scotland.

Summary of the issues facing women

Addressing the gender pay gap is a key element of delivering inclusive economic growth and in helping to tackle child poverty. This requires different decisions to be made.

There remains a lack of intersectional² data to help ensure that the needs of women in Scotland are considered in the development of policy.

The distribution of unpaid care remains heavily skewed toward women, in particular towards working age women. There is also a direct correlation between the number of hours spent caring and living in areas of multiple deprivation³. In the best performing countries, in terms of gender equality, the gender balance in providing care is more even. We know that flexible employment practices aimed at supporting carers who juggle work and caring responsibilities can play a large role in supporting this.

Availability of high quality, affordable, and flexible childcare is a central factor in enabling women to participate fully in the labour market.

Societal attitudes are key influencers on behaviours and from an early age, impact upon and shape the attitudes of girls and boys with respect to career options for women.

Subject choice at school is a key determinant of career choice. Subject choice is often skewed by gender with boys more likely to make subject choices which lead to a wider range of better paid jobs.

Despite some progress in recent years equality education, with a focus on the workplace, is still not a prominent element of Scottish education. While this cannot be expected to overcome all of the wider influences on children and young people's attitudes to gender stereotyping, it is an opportunity to equip them with the ability to form their own views.

Workplace and educational environments which tolerate harassment and violence against women narrow women's study and occupational choices and constrain their career ambitions.

Women are heavily over-represented in occupations which tend to be lower paid and undervalued compared to those which are male dominated. For example, 38.5% of women in employment work in low pay occupations⁴ compared to 20.6% of men. This equates to 1 in 3 women and 1 in 5 men.

² The overlap of various social identities, such as race, gender, sexuality, disability and class. It can contribute to the severity and nature of discrimination experienced by specific groups individuals.

³ <https://www.gov.scot/publications/scotlands-carers/>

⁴ These occupations include care, leisure and other service occupations, sales and customer service occupations or elementary occupations such as cleaners, or kitchen and catering assistants.

Women are many times more likely than men to take career breaks. Many who do, tend to find it difficult to re-enter the labour market at levels commensurate with their skills and experience.

More women are likely to work in part-time employment, 45% of women in employment work part-time, compared with 13% of men. They are also more likely to be in jobs which are more precarious.

The limited availability of good quality part-time jobs has an impact on the types of jobs women undertake and the level to which they progress.

The gender pay gap varies by geography with women living in islands and remote rural local authorities experiencing a higher gap than those living in mainly rural local authorities. It is also wider in Local Authorities with substantial urban populations than in more rural Local Authorities. In addition, women living in islands and remote Local Authorities experience much higher volatility in wages. In the years between 2012 and 2018 the hourly gender pay gap varied between 0 and 20%, but has fallen back to 4.5% in 2018. Reasons for the more volatile gender pay gap in the islands and remote Local Authorities are likely to include the underlying fragility of the local labour market where there are limited opportunities to adjust to changing economic circumstances. These trends are furthered by a reliance on employment in low paid, seasonal or unpredictable sectors such as accommodation and food services (including tourism-related activities) and higher levels of part-time working. Reduced mobility and lack of formal childcare are also more common in remote rural Scotland⁵.

In general women with additional protected characteristics (including disabled women, minority ethnic women and older women); living in areas of multiple deprivation; and those caring for sick and disabled relatives tend to experience greater labour market inequalities.

Women suffering domestic abuse are more likely to have interrupted and constrained careers.

While occupational segregation by gender is a significant driver of the gender pay gap, it is not the only one. Even when women and men enter the labour market on an equal basis in the same professions, pay gaps quickly emerge.

Employer practices, such as differential access to training and biased and non-transparent promotion procedures, can often disadvantage women at different career stages.

The rate of women involved in starting or running their own business is much lower than that of men.

⁵ <https://www.sruc.ac.uk/ruralgenderpaygap>

Analytical Summary

To complement the Gender Pay Gap Action Plan we have published an analysis of the actions contained within the Plan. This analysis is presented as a logic model which sets out the main causes of the gender pay gap and examines how the policy commitments in the Plan can be expected to impact the gender pay gap, while also considering gender equality more broadly along with its intersectional dimensions. A copy of this analysis can be found at <https://www.gov.scot/publications/fairer-scotland-women-gender-pay-gap-action-plan/analytical-annex/>

Implementation Statement

We have established a Fair Work and Gender Equality Ministerial Working Group. Led by the Minister for Business, Fair Work and Skills and whose membership consists of Ministers whose portfolios link into both the Fair Work and Gender Pay Gap Action Plans. The Ministerial Group will drive a more strategic and embedded approach to fair work and gender equality across portfolios. The remit of the Ministerial Working Group includes galvanising action to drive forward a cross-portfolio approach to tackling the causes of the gender pay gap.

A Scottish Government Fair Work Champion will be appointed to promote Fair Work across Directorates within the Scottish Government. Furthermore, each Directorate will be asked to develop Directorate-level Fair Work Action Plans, which set out the actions that are currently being taken or planned to mainstream Fair Work into policy areas and activities specific to the Directorate, and to develop a strong Directorate-specific Fair Work narrative.

The Scottish Government Fair Work Champion and Directors will be supported by a Fair Work and Gender Equality Officials Working Group.

Monitoring and Evaluating the Impact of the Action Plan

The Fair Work and Gender Equality Ministerial Working Group will provide a challenge function to the action that is being taken. The Scottish Government will also undertake to provide the Scottish Parliament with annual reports on progress in reducing the gender pay gap via the Economy, Jobs and Fair Work Committee.

We will measure the impact of this action plan across a range of indicators and measures which we will publish separately.

Acknowledgements

We have many people to thank in helping to shape the development of this action plan. First, we acknowledge the many individuals and organisations that participated in the policy discussion sessions and voices events. The valuable contributions of all who participated are reflected in our Plan.

Thanks go to members of the Gender Pay Gap Working Group for their contribution towards the development of actions within this Plan. Additional thanks to Close the Gap and Engender who led in providing detailed background discussion papers for the eight themed stakeholder workshops. These papers offered challenge to policymakers working across the Scottish Government and significantly helped in the development of recommendations which shaped this Plan. We would also like to thank Professor Alan McGregor for his contribution to the facilitation of these workshops.



Chapter 1

LEADERSHIP

Gender equality is both a fundamental human right and a key driver of inclusive economic growth. That is why the Scottish Government will show leadership in tackling the gender pay gap by looking more explicitly at all our policies, including future Programmes for Government, through a gendered lens to allow particular attention to be given to the implications of policies in terms of gender.

Our approach across our range of Labour Market Action Plans, our Tackling Child Poverty Delivery Plan 2018-22⁶ and Equally Safe Delivery Plan⁷, which was co-authored with COSLA, is about not only supporting women outside the workplace but also enabling women to fully, safely and equally participate in employment.

In order to address wider issues around gender inequality in Scotland we have established a National Advisory Council on Women and Girls. The Council's first report⁸ published in January 2019 makes eleven key recommendations across a number of policies similar to those contained within this action

plan. We are currently considering these will be publishing a full and considered response by spring 2019.

Local government also has a role to play in promoting gender equality, tackling inequalities and encouraging diversity amongst elected members and its workforce. COSLA's President has asserted her and COSLA's commitment to this agenda.

Many of those in leadership roles in the public and private sector are men. Progress must involve their full commitment. Everyone in positions of influence should understand the causes of the gender pay gap and how their decisions can influence change.

6 <https://www.gov.scot/publications/child-chance-tackling-child-poverty-delivery-plan-2018-22/pages/1/>

7 <https://www.gov.scot/publications/equally-safe-delivery-plan-scotlands-strategy-prevent-violence-against-women/>

8 <https://onescotland.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/01/2018-Report.pdf>

WE WILL OVER THE COURSE OF 2019-20:

- Start the process of work to ensure that our own policymakers, analysts and delivery bodies are sufficiently competent in their understanding of intersectional gender issues to design policy and services that advance women's equality, particularly in relation to the labour market and economy. This will include our current contract with WiSE Research Centre for Economic Justice to carry out a project on improving the gender competence of analysts and policy-makers, being run initially on a pilot basis in the Finance, Economy and Fair Work portfolio.
- Support the Fair Work Convention's role in supporting equality of opportunity and outcomes in the labour market and work with the Convention to promote understanding and application of the Fair Work Framework in workplaces across the country.
- Work with our Non Departmental Public Bodies and Agencies through our Sponsorship teams to reduce their own gender pay gaps and to tackle the overall gender pay gap, including specific issues faced by women who have other protected characteristics, such as disabled women within Scotland's labour market through their service delivery.
- Undertake further analysis on the impact of the budget on gender, including further consideration of distributional analysis and the intra-household distribution of resources.
- Improve the intersectional data available for all policy officers across national and local government to help with the development of future policies.
- Develop our sustainable procurement tools and guidance to help buyers across the public sector in Scotland identify and pursue equality outcomes in relevant procurements, and identify a suitable public contract requirement from which we can develop an exemplary case study of how public sector equality duties can be met with respect to gender and procurement.
- Undertake a review of the specific duties underpinning the public sector equality duty. That review will take into account stakeholders' views and a range of evidence, such as the Is Scotland Fairer?⁹ report published by the Equality and Human Rights Commission. The aim will be to move from a culture of compliance to one that supports progress in delivering equality and a fairer Scotland.
- Undertake an Equal Pay Audit to help us to understand the causes of the Scottish Government's own gender pay gap.

⁹ <https://www.equalityhumanrights.com/en/publication-download/scotland-fairer-2018>



Chapter 2

EMPLOYMENT

This chapter looks at what action we must immediately undertake to address workplace practices which discriminate, undervalue and underutilise the skills and potential of women, and in particular disabled women, older women and minority ethnic women, if we are to succeed in tackling the gender pay gap.

What we are doing

As outlined later in this document many of the conditions for creating and sustaining the gender pay gap are set before women enter the workforce. The actions that we and our partners will be taking now and over the rest of this parliamentary term to address these conditions will take many years to have an impact on the gender pay gap.

The Equality and Human Rights Commission (EHRC) have explored the race, disability and gender pay gaps in their 2017 progress report. Research¹⁰ undertaken by Close the Gap also identifies the intertwined set of gendered and racial barriers that affect minority ethnic women's ability

to enter, progress and stay in good quality employment. We have used the evidence within these and many other reports to help shape this action plan and its supporting analysis paper.

At any time, failing to capture potential of the workforce at your disposal on the grounds of gender is both discriminatory and short sighted. As we face into Brexit and other potentially seismic changes in the labour market, it is an absolute economic imperative that we make use of all the talents at our disposal. Findings from the BMG/Equality and EHRC¹¹ poll suggest that businesses with larger pay gaps than their competitors are at risk of losing out on talent and reduced loyalty from employees, and of suffering reputational

10 <https://www.closesthegap.org.uk/content/resources/Still-Not-Visible.pdf>

11 <https://www.bmgresearch.co.uk/gender-pay-gap-employee-poll/>

damage if they do not take action to reduce it, placing them at a competitive disadvantage. The Scottish Parliament's Economy, Jobs and Fair Work committee published a report called 'No Small Change'¹² following their inquiry into the gender pay gap in Scotland. This inquiry examined the business case for addressing the gender pay gap.

There is no shortage of ability among women coming into the labour market. Women go to university in much higher numbers than men and often predominate on high demand courses such as medicine. Despite this across disciplines we see women's graduate earnings fall behind men's as soon as five years after graduation¹³. In the UK, three in five professional women returning to the workforce after maternity leave are also more likely to return into lower skilled or lower paid roles than they left, experiencing an immediate earnings reduction of up to third¹⁴.

Among women in low paid occupations, the situation is often worse with some occupations being low paid solely because of the way skills and values are socially constructed which can mean that certain types of work generally undertaken by women is undervalued. We know that some minority ethnic communities are over represented in low paid work, because of a number of different factors including

challenges around the recognition of qualifications gained from outside of the UK. We can also see pay increase as the proportion of men entering an occupation rises¹⁵ meanwhile the reverse occurs as sectors feminise¹⁶.

Women working in male dominated workplaces can be more likely to experience sexual harassment¹⁷ and within some rural sectors be unable to access appropriate personal protective equipment¹⁸. For many women this can contribute towards occupational segregation and choosing lower paid occupations in exchange for a safer female dominated environment.

While increasing income from employment is the most sustainable route out of poverty, the majority of families in poverty already include someone in work. To address in-work poverty, our Tackling Child Poverty Delivery Plan identifies the need to ensure that there is access to high quality jobs with a decent rate of pay, good training and support, opportunities to progress, a flexible work environment, and enough hours in work to meet basic family needs. This is also key for addressing some of the poverty issues women face in later life.

Child and family poverty is particularly gendered for many reasons. Women still take on most of the caring roles in households and women with children face a range of barriers to paid

12 http://www.parliament.scot/S5_EconomyJobsFairWork/Reports/EJFWS052017R06.pdf

13 <https://www.gov.scot/publications/graduate-outcomes-university-subject-leo-data-2015-16-scotland/>

14 <https://www.pwc.co.uk/services/economics-policy/insights/women-returners.html>

15 <https://www.journals.uchicago.edu/doi/full/10.1086/682955>

16 https://people.unil.ch/danieloesch/files/2014/05/Murphy_Oesch_2015_Feminization_Occupations_Change_Wages.pdf

17 Pew Research Centre, "Majority of Women in Male-Dominated Workplaces Say Sexual Harassment is a Problem in Their Industry," Fact Tank, March 7, 2018.

18 <https://www.gov.scot/publications/women-farming-agriculture-sector/pages/2/>

employment and progression. It is much harder for lone parents (predominantly women) to earn enough on return to the formal labour market to cover costs for children and some cannot access child maintenance from ex-partners. Wider social structures and power relations mean that parents will not automatically share the same access to resources, whether from paid work or social security. In the household setting women tend to lose out. So barriers for women in the labour market which lead to the existence of the gender pay gap also contribute to the existence of poverty. This is even more acute for child poverty, as it is women who typically take on the bulk of childcare responsibilities.

Largely because of these caring responsibilities, many women choose occupations which offer more flexible working patterns. However, the flexible jobs market is limited, with only 12% of quality jobs advertised with flexible options in Scotland at the point of hire. Furthermore, male-dominated workplaces tend not to offer flexibility in relation to work patterns or hours of employment¹⁹, which has a hugely disproportionate impact on working-age women, particularly those with children²⁰. It also has an impact on employers who are missing out on attracting talent by failing to promote and offer support and flexibility at the point of recruitment. Women who have negotiated flexibility with their employer can find themselves blocked from progression as there is only a very limited flexible jobs market for them to access. The need for more flexible

working is already a real problem, and one that is likely to become more intense, as the population continues to age and caring responsibilities expand.

The Scottish Government funded research – ‘An Investigation of Pensioner Employment²¹’, and ‘Older People and Employment in Scotland²²’ highlighted that older workers have experienced ageism in the labour market, and felt that their skills and experience were undervalued. Some were worried that they might be discriminated against on grounds of age if they left their current employer to look for a new job. There was also evidence to suggest that ageist and sexist attitudes amongst employers may interact, with the result that older women may end up in jobs for which they are over-qualified and underpaid. This can be seen as a contributing factor to gender pay gap and pensioner poverty in later-life.

The introduction of the gender pay gap reporting regulations (2017) is still relatively recent and it is clear that it may take some time for this legislation to have its desired impact.

There are employers across Scotland who are taking steps to improve the gender pay gaps within their organisations, however some of the actions will require time to yield results.

We are all faced also with the immediate risks of Brexit. It has therefore never been more important to fully maximise the skills, ingenuity and contribution of women in Scotland’s labour market.

That is why we are encouraging

19 <https://www.familyfriendlyworkingscotland.org.uk/resources/FINAL-Timewise-Scotland-Report.pdf>

20 <https://www.familyfriendlyworkingscotland.org.uk/resources/UK-MFI-2018-Employers-Report-A4-FINAL-1.pdf>

21 <https://www.gov.scot/publications/investigation-pensioner-employment/>

22 <https://www.gov.scot/publications/older-people-employment-scotland/>

employers to consider what actions they can take to do this. The UK Government Equalities Office reported that as of May 2018, just under half (48%) of employers subject to the gender pay gap regulations had published action plans outlining how they intend to tackle their gender pay gap. There has also been some criticism²³ about the quality of the plans in terms of meaningful activity that was time-bound, target-driven and evaluated. We therefore continue to encourage employers to consider not only how to tackle their gender pay gaps but also to be transparent about their actions and to evaluate their effectiveness.

The Scottish Government has been taking and continues to take steps to address many of these issues.

As outlined in our Fair Work Action Plan, we continue to support strong trade unions in Scotland. Trade unions play an important role in improving the employment conditions of women and advancing gender equality in employment.

Pay

As highlighted by the EHRC report a common theme in tackling pay gaps across equality groups was the introduction of the national minimum wage as it hugely helped women, minority ethnic and disabled people who are over represented in low paid work. That is why we are continuing to support the Poverty Alliance to deliver the living wage across Scotland. We are providing them with £340,000 in 2018-19 to uplift a further 7,500 workers across Scotland to at least the Living Wage rate, giving particular attention to low paid sectors such as Hospitality

and Tourism where many of the workers are females working part-time.

Since the Scottish Living Wage Accreditation Initiative launched in Scotland in 2014 there have been 987 uplifts in hospitality. By focusing on this sector the Poverty Alliance have facilitated 393 uplifts, since April 2018, demonstrating that a sector based approach has had a positive impact. We remain keen to work with the Poverty Alliance to explore further a gender and geographical focus to ensure we continue to impact areas where females are paid below the real Living Wage.

The good example local authorities set by paying the Living Wage can have a positive influence on employers within their area to follow suit, which is to the benefit of their local communities and the wider economy.

The Living Wage place programme advocates a place based approach to promoting the Living Wage and seeks to engage major local public and private sector employers, including Local Authorities to develop this in their areas. The Scottish Government continues to work collaboratively with the Poverty Alliance in developing place based recognition. We congratulate Dundee's commitment to becoming the first city in Scotland, and the rest of the UK, to launch their Action Plan setting out their collaborative work to "Make Dundee a Living Wage City."

The real Living Wage is paid to workers engaged in the delivery of 94% of Scottish Government contracts. Although this is a step in the right direction, we will continue to strive towards 100%.

23 https://www.equalityhumanrights.com/sites/default/files/closing-the-gender-pay-gap_0.pdf

In recognition of the need to improve recruitment and retention of the adult social care workforce and address low wages in the sector, the Scottish Government and COSLA are promoting the payment of the real Living Wage in public sector contract settings, involving the third and independent sector where wages have tended to be lower. A commitment was made by the Scottish Government and COSLA to pay the real Living Wage from 1 October 2016 to care workers providing direct care and support to adults in care homes, care at home, and housing support. This commitment is benefiting up to 40,000 staff, many of whom are women and in 2018/19 is being extended to cover hours where a sleepover is provided.

Furthermore, payment of the real Living Wage will be promoted through our commitment to Fair Work First. As stated within our Fair Work Action Plan we will work in partnership with the STUC and affiliate unions to increase the number of workers in Scotland covered by collective bargaining.

The Scottish Government has made a clear commitment to promoting collective bargaining through the inclusion of an employee voice indicator, measured by collective bargaining coverage, within the National Performance Framework.

Under the Equality Act 2010, women are entitled to equal pay with men doing equal work. This means that employers need to be confident that their pay system delivers equal pay and protects them against the risk of an equal pay claim. Just as the Scottish Government as an employer has made a commitment to undertake an equal

pay audit we would encourage other employers to consider doing so too.

In 2016, to help to improve transparency around the gender pay gap we lowered the threshold for listed public authorities in Scotland to publish their gender pay gap every two years, from those with more than 150 employees to those with more than 20 employees.

Workplace Practices

To help employers deliver innovative solutions to overcome workforce inequalities, including helping them to identify and close their gender pay gaps, we are providing £750,000 to the Workplace Equality Fund²⁴. Learning from across the 22 projects being supported through the Fund will be shared with other employers.

In 2017-18 we delivered on our commitment for a Returner's programme to assist women to re-enter the workforce following a career break. 'Returnships' can play an important role in bringing experienced women back into their previous career after a break, helping them update skills and knowledge, and enabling employers to gain from retaining skilled staff. One of the projects funded through this programme was specifically aimed at supporting minority ethnic women to return to work within the manufacturing sector. Going forward the Scottish Government recognises that we need to significantly upscale this programme and consider how going forward it can be targeted at supporting women with other protected characteristics²⁵ and focus on sectors where women are significantly under-represented.

²⁴ <https://www.voluntaryactionfund.org.uk/funding-and-support/workplace-equality-fund/>

²⁵ Disabled women, minority ethnic women and older women

“It has given us a rich opportunity to bring fresh ideas into the company, improved our ability to focus on new areas of the business, as well as an early opportunity to learn from building a team. It has also strengthened our belief that a diverse workforce is of great importance and an area we will continue to advocate for and build our own culture around.”

satou Njai, Drink Baotic. Placement provider on returner programme

We will also expand the Carer Positive employer accreditation scheme to ensure that it reaches a wider range of employers. The scheme encourages employers to put in place flexible, fair and supportive policies and practices to support the carers in their workforce and provides recognition to those employers who do this.

In December 2018 we published A Fairer Scotland For Disabled People: Employment Action Plan²⁶. This Plan sets out the range of actions which will support the Scottish Government’s ambition to at least halve the disability employment gap in Scotland, including improved support for employers, particularly around recruitment and retention. The plan recognises that the barriers that exist for disabled people can also intersect by gender, race, religion, sexuality and class.

We have sought to develop an understanding of the motivations, opportunities and barriers experienced by older workers and employers around later-life working. This has helped to inform our policies on supporting older workers who wish to extend their working lives. We will continue to work in partnership with the University of Edinburgh, Age Scotland, Business

In the Community, and Chartered Institute for Professional Development to share good practice and to promote adoption of more age-inclusive working practices to employers.

In January 2019 we funded a conference, which was designed by the Scottish Women’s Convention, to look at women’s lived experience of transitioning through the menopause.

Tackling the Motherhood Penalty

We have demonstrated our continued commitment to tackling workplace pregnancy and maternity discrimination through our work with partners, including EHRC, Advisory, Conciliation and Arbitration Service (ACAS), Federation of Small Businesses, businesses and women working in particular sectors. This work has included creating best practice guidelines for employers, hosting a series of employer training events across Scotland on maternity and the rights and responsibilities for both employers and employees, before, during and after pregnancy; as well as improving access to guidance and advice for pregnant women and new mothers.

Within our Letter of Guidance 2018-19 to Skills Development Scotland (SDS) we have asked them to explore how the experience of pregnant women and young mothers in accessing, participating in and completing national training programmes might be improved. We are also exploring with SDS the most appropriate means of promoting EHRC advice to employers on supporting pregnancy and maternity in the workplace, within the context of other SDS support for business and current resources. We will seek to also do this with other public bodies.

26 <https://www.gov.scot/publications/fairer-scotland-disabled-people-employment-action-plan/>

Flexible working and thinking about job design is crucially important to women who have caring responsibilities, to disabled women, and for those who wish to change their working patterns as they approach the end of their working life. It is particularly important in increasing family incomes to tackle child poverty. There is some evidence to show²⁷ that in minority ethnic households with extended families, people are brought up with the cultural expectation that they will look after their family members, many therefore can find it difficult to strike the balance between caring and continuing with their jobs. The Scottish Government is keen to encourage employers to normalise flexibility for all employees and to recognise that these types of adjustments are reasonable and a necessary part of creating a fairer Scotland and enabling a better work life balance for all employees. Businesses have a huge amount to gain from offering flexible working in terms of staff retention and motivation; skills optimisation; productivity; staff diversity; and business costs in terms of carbon foot print and office space²⁸.

To support and promote development of flexible workplaces to employers we are also continuing to provide funding for 2018-19 to Family Friendly Working Scotland (FFWS) Partnership. Later this year we will be working FFWS to hold a festival aimed at inspiring more employers to implement flexible ways of working and to provide them with practical know how to increase the numbers of individuals able to access flexible working.

Tackling gendered assumptions about who works and who cares is crucial to broadening parental choice and in tackling the gender pay gap. The Modern Families Index²⁹, published by Working Families and Bright Horizons, shows that young fathers are becoming increasingly involved in caring for their children and want to become more so but blame their employers for their lack of work-life balance. There is also some research showing a link between increased paternity leave and a range of positive outcomes, including an increase in the mother's earnings and greater maternal wellbeing³⁰. There are some employers in Scotland that offer enhanced leave or pay, including the Scottish Government, which offers staff four weeks' paternity leave on full pay. We would however like to see an increase in the numbers that do so and would encourage employers to work in partnership with their workforce to consider voluntarily offering enhanced paternity leave.

Seniority Gap

It is encouraging to see some sectors³¹ within the labour market exploring the issue of how to get more women into senior roles and what interventions are likely to make the biggest difference.

We remain committed to improving the representation of women and other under-represented groups in positions of seniority within a business, leadership roles within boards and to making ministerial appointments more diverse and reflective of Scotland's

27 <https://publications.parliament.uk/pa/cm201516/cmselect/cmwomeq/584/584.pdf>

28 <https://timewise.co.uk/insights/business-case-for-flexible-working/>

29 <https://www.workingfamilies.org.uk/news/increased-paternity-leave-is-an-opportunity-for-business-to-re-engage-a-lost-generation-of-fathers-at-work/>

30 <http://www.fatherhoodinstitute.org/2014/fi-research-summary-paternity-leave/>

31 https://www.abi.org.uk/globalassets/files/publications/public/diversity/tackling_the_gender_seniority_gap_what_works_for_the_insurance_and_long_term_savings_industry.pdf

population. Increasing the talent pool available and supporting such participation will lead to the creation of strengthened Boards that are better able to understand customer needs and deliver improved outcomes, decision-making and corporate governance.

Through the Scottish Government's Partnership for Change, launched on 25 June 2015, we have been working with public bodies, third sector organisations and companies from across Scotland to encourage them to make a voluntary commitment to improve the diversity of their board and work towards 50/50 gender balance by 2020. The Partnership currently has 219 signatories.

Using our new legislative powers, through the Scotland Act 2016, the Gender Representation on Public Boards (Scotland) Act 2018 aims to lock in the gains we have already made to improving the number of women on public boards. In November 2015 the proportion of female board members in Scotland broke the symbolic 40% mark and continues to increase steadily, reaching 47.75% as at 1 October 2018.

Sexual Harassment

We are determined to tackle the scourge of sexual harassment both in the workplace and in wider society. That is why the Scottish Government is implementing Equally Safe, Scotland's strategy³² to prevent and eradicate all forms of violence against women and girls and has been encouraging employers to adopt robust policies and procedures. Close the Gap, are also being supported by the Scottish Government, to develop an employer accreditation

scheme 'Equally Safe at Work' which is in the process of being piloted. We would also encourage employers to follow in the steps of COSLA in signing up to the White Ribbon campaign which asks men to never commit, condone or remain silent about men's violence against women in all its forms.

Domestic Abuse

At least one in five women in Scotland will experience domestic abuse in her lifetime³³. Evidence from Scottish Women's Aid employability Building Equality project, which was funded by the Scottish Government, highlighted that perpetrators can exacerbate women's barriers to participate equally in the labour market by preventing women from attending work and discouraging women from applying for promotion or positions where they would become the primary earner in the household. That is why we welcome South Ayrshire Council's 'safe leave' provision which will enable employees, who experience domestic abuse, to take up to 10 days off to find the help and support they need for themselves and their families. As an employer the Scottish Government also has support in place through special leave to support employees. We would encourage other employers to consider what policies they could put in place to support the victims of domestic abuse.

While most of the legislative responsibilities relating to employment are reserved to Westminster, we will use the powers at our disposal to address the workplace issues relating to the gender pay gap.

32 <https://www.gov.scot/publications/equally-safe-delivery-plan-scotlands-strategy-prevent-violence-against-women/>

33 <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/People/Equality/violence-women/Key-Facts>

In addition to the actions identified in our other labour market action plans, in 2019-20 we will:

- Support women to stay in or return to work after a career break at levels commensurate with their abilities and experience through our planned £5m three-year Women Returners Programme. This programme will have a particular focus on supporting women with other protected characteristics, for example older women, disabled women, minority ethnic women; and focus on sectors where women are significantly under-represented.
- Through an expanded Workplace Equality Fund, based on the lessons learnt from the previous Fund, work with employers and trade unions to improve workplace practices (including support during menopause and for victims of domestic abuse) for the benefit of women with particular focus on supporting women who also have other protected characteristics³⁴.
- Undertake research into international practices on using wage setting powers within the public sector to reduce the incidence of low pay among women.
- We will work with women's organisations, and trade unions to gain a clearer picture of the issues faced by women transitioning through the menopause to identify other areas where action may need to be taken.
- Continue to support the adoption of the Fair Work Framework, which aims to address gender inequality across all dimensions of work – opportunity, security (including pay), fulfilment (including skills acquisition and deployment), respect and voice – and encourage application of the Framework through Fair Work First, our new approach to encouraging Fair Work practices among employers that receive Scottish Government funding.
- Conduct case study research into the ways that businesses can reduce their gender pay gaps, investigating the strategies they use and the barriers they face to help inform policy and guide businesses.
- Work with employers to persuade them to develop robust and meaningful gender pay gap action plans and support the Fair Work Convention with their employer engagement.

³⁴ Age, disability, gender reassignment, marriage and civil partnership, pregnancy and maternity, race, religion or belief, sex, sexual orientation

- Refresh the gender and diversity element of the Scottish Business Pledge to encourage actions and measures to address all aspects of diversity and inclusion, including the gender pay gap.
- Fund research on the career trajectories of mothers returning to work based on longitudinal data from the Understanding Society survey. This research will help us understand the barriers that mothers face when returning to work.
- As part of our ongoing commitment to tackle child poverty, we will fund a feasibility study for a 'Centre for Flexible Work' for Scotland. This Centre, a UK first, would design, test, embed and scale new approaches to increase the availability of quality, flexible work in Scotland. Its core aim would be to ensure that those who have the most to gain - low income parents - are supported to access this work and raise their living standards. Timewise will lead on the feasibility study, working with a wide range of partners in Scotland to develop plans for the Centre.
- Fund Family Friendly Working Scotland to support and promote the development of flexible workplaces to employers
- Continue to press the UK Government to amend Equality Act 2010 (Gender Pay Gap Information) Regulations 2017 to require employers to publish a gender pay gap action plan.
- Request that UK Government reinstates section 40 paragraphs (2)-(4) of the Equality Act and that it be amended to remove the requirement for the employer to know that the employee has been subjected to two or more incidences of harassment before they become liable.
- Urge the UK Government to strengthen and enforce protection to women (including pregnant women) and carers against discrimination and dismissal; strengthen paternity leave rights; introduce the right for all employees to request flexible working from day one of employment; and consider the introduction of 'safe leave' based on New Zealand's "Victims Protection Bill" that requires employers to give victims of domestic violence up to 10 days leave from work, separate from annual holiday and sick leave.

Chapter 3

EARLY LEARNING AND CHILDCARE



The Scottish Government recognises the importance of investing in our youngest children – so that every child has the best start in life and can reach their potential, regardless of their situation.

What we are doing

We are working with local government to deliver a transformational expansion in the funded entitlement to early learning and childcare (ELC) to 1,140 hours from August 2020 for all 3 and 4 year olds and for around one quarter of 2 year olds. Securing high quality experiences for all children is at the heart of our plans for the expansion, so that we can improve outcomes for all children and contribute towards closing the poverty-related attainment gap. This has the potential to make a significant impact on our country's future economic prosperity, and make both a short and long-term contribution to closing the gender pay gap.

We also know that childcare provision is one of our most important pieces of economic infrastructure. Childcare responsibility still sits predominantly with women. This means that it has a

disproportionate impact on women's access to study, training and work.

A major cause of the gender pay gap is the availability of affordable and flexible childcare provision. Without it, women with children either; leave the workforce; work part time or work in inflexible employment which under-utilises their skills and pays less. We want all families to have choices about how they balance work, training, income and care. Existing legislation requires local authorities to consult with local families and move towards more flexible provision based on what local families need. We know that flexibility has been improving and the expansion to 1,140 hours will offer parents greater choice over where and how they access their child's funded entitlement. There will be improved access to settings that open all year round or for extended days.

Our transformation of early learning and childcare – while primarily an investment in giving our children the best start in life – will empower more women to return to training or work, if they choose to do so.

The driving force behind expanding the funded ELC provision is ensuring a high quality experience for all children. This requires a dedicated, skilled and well-qualified workforce, but the sector can be characterised by low pay and occupational segregation which contributes significantly to the gender pay gap. It is also a workforce whose skills should be better valued by society for the contribution that they are making to the care and development of our youngest children, as well as towards achieving inclusive economic growth and tackling child poverty in Scotland.

We want the expansion of funded ELC to be underpinned by Fair Work principles and practices, in particular ensuring that staff are fairly remunerated. The [Financial Review](#) of Early Learning and Childcare in Scotland found that, in 2016, around 80% of practitioners and 50% of supervisors in private and third sector settings delivering the funded ELC entitlement were paid an hourly rate below the real Living Wage.

This situation cannot be allowed to continue. We want to see all workers in the ELC sector paid at least the real Living Wage. To support this, we have committed to providing the funding to enable local authorities to pay sustainable hourly rates to ELC providers, which are set at a level that enables the payment of the real Living Wage to childcare workers delivering the funded entitlement from August 2020. We are already seeing increases in the funding rates paid by local authorities to funded providers.

To deliver the expansion, we estimate that the ELC workforce in Scotland will have to grow by up to 11,000 people by 2020-21, creating high value employment opportunities across the length and breadth of Scotland. We have plans in place to expand the capacity of relevant college and university courses, and modern apprenticeships to support this expansion. These plans are set out in the Skills Investment Plan published by SDS in January 2018 and our own ELC Workforce Delivery Plan.

We are also running an ongoing national recruitment campaign to attract more people into the profession, with a particular focus on school-leavers, career-changers and parental-returns. Only 4% of the current ELC workforce is male, and so we are over-representing men in our campaign materials to attract more men into careers in early learning and childcare.

Children benefit from a diverse ELC workforce. Increasing the number of men in the workforce will mean children experience different perspectives and have more male role models to look up to. We are committed to attracting in new entrants to the sector from other groups who are currently under-represented; this includes more people from minority ethnic communities, those with disabilities and those with language skills. We are funding the Scottish Funding Council (SFC) to run a new Men in Early Years Challenge Fund for colleges and are funding the Council of Ethnic Minority Voluntary Organisations (CEMVO), which represents minority ethnic communities, to raise awareness of and promote the opportunity of a career in ELC.

Childhood and play are becoming more gendered and polarised between girls and boys. Toys, books, clothing and other items for children are increasingly being produced and marketed along gender lines³⁵. Evidence shows that gender stereotyping from a very early age has an impact on the decisions that girls and boys make about their future subject and career choices. The consistent application of the early years curriculum can also make a fundamental contribution to tackling gender stereotyping by ensuring that our youngest children play and learn without being restricted by these stereotypes.

To support staff working in early learning and childcare the Care Inspectorate and Zero Tolerance have co-developed practice resources for staff on promoting gender equality. *Gender Equal Play*³⁶ explains the importance of challenging gender stereotyping and provides ideas and examples for early years professionals of existing good practice.

“Modelling equality and challenging gender stereotypes from an early age is important to ensure children develop values and skills which support them throughout their lives³⁷.”

The Monkey House Childminding, Dumfries.

We recognise that many families who use either a childminder or nursery before their children become eligible for publicly-funded childcare, usually at age three, can be asked to pay a deposit of as much as £900. That is why in Edinburgh, Glasgow and Dumfries and Galloway, we have been piloting a childcare deposit guarantee scheme to support parents who are returning to work or training. We are working closely with NHS Health Scotland to evaluate its impact.

We have also been working in partnership with One Parent Families Scotland in Dundee, to offer high quality registered care in the child's own home, 7 days a week from early morning to late evening, as required by the family. Such flexible childcare is vital in allowing women to work, learn, and develop their employability skills.

35 Peer Toy Play as a Gateway to Children's Gender Flexibility: The Effect of (Counter) Stereotypic Portrayals of Peers in Children's Magazines, in Sex Roles Journal of Research, Spinner L, Cameron L, Calogero R, 2018. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC6096659/>

36 <http://www.careinspectorate.com/images/documents/4704/Gender%20equal%20play%20in%20early%20learning%20and%20childcare.pdf>

37 <http://www.careinspectorate.com/images/documents/4704/Gender%20equal%20play%20in%20early%20learning%20and%20childcare.pdf>

In keeping this agenda moving forward we will in:

2019 - 20

- Ask Education Scotland and Care Inspectorate to take account of gender equality through their scrutiny activities.
- Continue to work in partnership with education and training providers and the third sector to test new ways to encourage men into the early learning and childcare sector, supporting our efforts to diversify the workforce.

2020 - 22

- Ensure successful implementation of the real Living Wage commitment for funded provider settings from 2020 that forms part of the new Funding Follows the Child approach, and build on this with a more ambitious target around pay to be set thereafter.
- In the next review of the national occupational standards and resulting qualifications for the early learning and childcare and out of school care sector, we will consider how to build addressing gender stereotyping and occupational segregation into training.
- Over the course of this Parliament we will develop and consult on a plan for after-school and holiday childcare, setting out the steps we will take in the next Parliament to further improve and expand early learning and childcare.

2024

- Undertake by 2024 an evaluation to determine the impact the significant investment to increase the number of funded hours to 1,140 per year has had on improving the outcomes for children; on labour market outcomes for parents, particularly on women; and consider what further action may be required to further strengthen women's equal access to the labour market.



Chapter 4 SCHOOLS

As Scotland's society is evolving in its attitudes to gender differences so too are our schools in their culture and practice. We see through Curriculum for Excellence, a significant emphasis on developing young people's confidence and aspirations as learners and members of society. In relation to the causes of the gender pay gap, schools have a key role to play and further progress to make in helping young women make transitions into a broader range of more successful careers.

What we are doing

While there are already some differences between girls' and boys' ambitions in primary school, these clearly widen in secondary and beyond, as evidenced by the different subject choices that girls and boys make in school. For example, persistent gender imbalances remain in the STEM subjects taken in the senior phase, despite female attainment being higher than male in the SQA STEM (Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics) qualifications, including in Physics, Computing and the Technologies. There is also longitudinal evidence of gender imbalance in National Qualifications in health and wellbeing subject

areas. Girls in SIMD (Scottish Index of Multiple Deprivation) 1 and 2 predominantly choose to study Child Development and Child Care and Care which is characterised by low pay and occupational segregation contributing significantly to the gender pay gap.

Wider society and culture have a significant role to play. However, we must continue to build on the work which is already taking place in schools to provide safe, nurturing environments in which ambition is fostered and in which all young people are encouraged and supported to make choices based on their own interests, talents and ambitions.

There is also evidence, as outlined in the Equally Safe Delivery Plan and report by the Young Women Lead Committee, that girls can be marginalised at crucial stages by sexist behaviours – including harassment and violence – which can go unchallenged and unrecorded.

Clearly teachers have a key role to play in addressing these issues. That is why the General Teaching Council Standard (GTCS) for Full Registration makes clear that Professional Values and Personal Commitment, including a commitment to social justice, are core to being a teacher. Equality is currently threaded through all Initial Teacher Education programmes with discrete elements exploring both practice and theory. This includes challenging gender stereotyping and occupational segregation.

Understanding gender equality, holding positive attitudes towards girls and boys, and having the opportunity to learn about gender issues, are essential if all pupils are to become confident individuals, successful learners, responsible citizens and effective contributors. Curriculum for Excellence provides schools with an opportunity to integrate action for gender equality and other forms of social justice into the process of developing and implementing the curriculum at school level, but more action is needed in order to achieve this aspiration.

As part of the prevention work taking place under Equally Safe, Scotland's strategy to prevent and eradicate violence against women and girls, we are funding a 'whole school' project led by Rape Crisis Scotland and Zero Tolerance. This pilot project works with schools, faculty and pupils to address challenges in understanding and tackling gender inequality, and everyday manifestations of gender-based violence in the whole school environment.

The inspection framework for schools also has an important role to play. Currently, the Education Scotland self-evaluation framework for schools – the How Good is Our School publication – recommends that schools make children aware of a range of careers and the skills required for them, and to think critically about how they challenge gender stereotypes within careers. It also encourages schools to be proactive in addressing gender imbalances across the curriculum and challenging any prejudice-based choices about future careers and learning pathways.

However, we recognise that there is a need for a greater emphasis on these issues and that schools and teachers can only do so if they are supported by relevant on going training and development opportunities.

That is why we will build on existing good practice identified through the Improving Gender Balance (IGB) programme and positive steps already in place through the STEM Education and Training Strategy³⁸; and the Developing the Young Workforce (DYW) programme.

The IGB Programme, funded by SDS, was an action research project involving six school clusters, which trialled ways of challenging stereotyping in learning from early learning and childcare through to upper secondary school and to help young people to make informed career choices. An evaluation of the project³⁹ found evidence of:

- Greater awareness amongst teachers and senior managers of unconscious bias, including gender bias – and how it manifests itself within their activities and what steps need to be taken to promote gender balance.
- Greater awareness of gender issues among learners – with this feeding into students talking about gender issues more often. For example, a number of teachers highlighted that students are more likely to confront bias, stereotyping or throwaway remarks than in the past.

Education Scotland has already published a suite of Improving Gender Balance action guides for teachers and early learning and childcare practitioners to promote the findings and successful practice identified in these pilots.

As a result of the successful evaluation of the pilot, as part of the STEM strategy, a new team of six Gender Balance and Equalities Officers has been recruited by Education Scotland. The team will take the approaches developed in the pilot and seek to embed those in every school cluster in Scotland by 2022. It will deliver gender and equality training to schools and teachers and develop a gender champion network and a gender kitemark to grow and spread best practice. The work will be undertaken in collaboration with the six new Regional Improvement Collaboratives along with the new Education Scotland STEM Regional Advisors who have recently been appointed. This forms part of our five year STEM Education and Training strategy and the team will support and encourage early learning and childcare settings and schools to adopt holistic, whole school approaches that seek to tackle gender balance issues across the curriculum and life of the establishment.

“Staff are now aware of the messages we present to pupils and we actively consider gender balance when designing any course materials or interventions³⁹.”

38 <https://www.gov.scot/publications/science-technology-engineering-mathematics-education-training-strategy-scotland/>

39 <https://www.skillsdevelopmentscotland.co.uk/media/44705/review-of-improving-gender-balance-2018.pdf>

Our STEM Education and Training Strategy seeks a significant reduction in the equity gap in participation and achievement in STEM learning, engagement and study across all sectors of education and training. The Strategy recognises that STEM imbalances in participation are evident right across the education and training landscape and that these feed through into the labour market. The first annual report on the work of the Strategy was published 7 February 2019⁴⁰. Through the Strategy we have also made a commitment to support early learning and childcare settings to promote positive engagement with STEM and tackle gender stereotyping through parental and family engagement. Other actions in the strategy are aimed at promoting gender equality in participation in STEM at college, university and apprenticeship settings with the science centres and festivals also promoting events targeted at women and girls.

Work will also continue to implement the 3-18 Career Education Standard, Work Placement Standard and Guidance on School Employer Partnerships. This will promote career management and employability skills for girls, as well as boys, and help to connect learning to the skills required for learning, life and work. In tackling gender stereotypes from early years and challenging gender-based subject choices as learners progress into the Senior Phase, we will support implementation of DYW Recommendations 26 and 28⁴¹ and further progress equality in Scotland's early learning and childcare settings and classrooms.

We are undertaking this work while also taking forward a programme of Education Reform, the focus of which is to create a school and led education system and therefore to empower our schools and school leaders. Progress is also being made on the development of different career pathways for teachers. An independent panel tasked with this is also considering new leadership opportunities and roles for teachers and Headteachers.

40 <https://www.gov.scot/policies/science-and-research/stem-education-training/>

41 <https://www.gov.scot/publications/developing-young-workforce-scotlands-youth-employment-strategy/>

In addition we will in 2019-20:

- In line with SFC and SDS, Education Scotland, in consultation with relevant stakeholders, unions and the workforce, develop and publish in 2020 an equality action plan with issues of gender segregation in education to the fore.
- Develop professional learning approaches in collaboration with practitioners in early learning and childcare and schools with a specific focus on challenging gender stereotyping and addressing unconscious bias.
- Ask the General Teaching Council to update, as appropriate, the GTC Standard to add a greater emphasis on gender stereotyping and occupational segregation.
- Work with the Scottish Council of Deans of Education to consider how gender and other equality issues can be made more prominent with Initial Teacher Education.
- Build on the work SDS is taking forward with parents on Apprenticeships, by asking them to expand this work to wider gender stereotyping which impacts on subject choices.
- Convene a Personal and Social Education (PSE) Lead Officers network, consisting of all local authorities and key third sector partners such as Rape Crisis Scotland, Zero Tolerance, Scottish Youth Parliament and Children's Parliament. The network will develop support for schools to tackle sexual harassment, including resources for teachers. The network will also develop supporting resources for pupils.
- In addition to taking forward the *Equally Safe* actions relating to schools, collaborate with COSLA and the teaching unions to develop mechanisms to collect and report on sexual harassment and violence against girls in schools.
- Accelerate progress on the Developing Young Workforce (DYW): Scotland's Youth Employment Strategy interventions to reduce gender imbalance and undertake a practice and improvement evaluation of the equality outcomes in Developing Young Workforce. This will involve the development of an evidence base of existing practice, the identification of good practice and the sharing of this across schools, colleges and the DYW Regional Groups.
- Work with employers to conduct a review to identify the extent to which industry-led DYW regional groups and other school/industry partnerships are delivering actions that will address gender stereotyping and occupational segregation.
- Deliver a new careers strategy by autumn 2019 to set the vision for high quality career information, advice and guidance services accessible to all, and which reflects the importance of challenging occupational segregation.

The Scottish Government understand that this will be challenging given the range of priorities our schools face. However, given the important impact schools can have on women's career outcomes and on economic growth, we will encourage and support them to pay careful attention to how classroom experiences shape gender differences in future choices and aspirations. For schools, this can build on work they are already doing to support children and young people's health and well-being, to close the attainment gap and to prepare children and young people for the world of work.



We know that as young people progress through the education system, their ideas about gender and work become increasingly fixed. This results in their concentration in subjects based on gender stereotypes which along with employer practices can lead to occupational segregation.

What we are doing

That is why our DYW Strategy is focussed on improving equality and diversity. The DYW's 4th annual report published in December 2018⁴², highlighted the progress being made across a number of key performance indicators.

The SFC⁴³, further and higher education institutions, SDS⁴⁴ and contracted training providers have been making some inroads in improving equality and diversity through their Equality Action Plans, which were developed in partnership with key stakeholders.

These plans have clear targets on reducing the gap between male and female participation in apprenticeships and undergraduate study. SDS have published their third annual report and the SFC have published their second annual report in January 2019⁴⁵. Colleges and universities are developing their own gender action plans on the back of this. However gender segregation in further and higher education and within apprenticeships is significantly ingrained in the system and in workplaces. We will continue to work with the SFC and SDS to ensure progress on their Action Plans.

42 <https://www.gov.scot/publications/developing-young-workforce-fourth-annual-progress-report-2017-18/pages/9/>

43 http://www.sfc.ac.uk/web/FILES/Corporate_publications_SFCCP052016_GenderActionPlan/SFCCP052016_Gender_Action_Plan.pdf

44 <https://www.skillsdevelopmentscotland.co.uk/media/44830/apprenticeship-equality-action-plan.pdf>

45 <http://www.sfc.ac.uk/publications-statistics/corporate-publications/2019/SFCCP012019.aspx>

In relation to STEM, we know that the proportion of female graduates remaining in the sector has increased from 27% in 2012 to 30% in 2017⁴⁶ while in academia the number of Scottish STEM (including medicine) departments holding Athena SWAN awards which recognise efforts to enhance gender equality rose from 3 in 2012 to 73 in Spring 2017 and the number of female professors in maths and chemistry have significantly increased.

A joint Scottish Government and Young Scot social media campaign has been launched to increase gender balance participation in STEM study at college and university. It will encourage young women to study traditionally male subjects at college and university by challenging stereotypes and highlighting possible career paths and advantages to studying STEM.

Scottish Government funds Equate Scotland to take forward a range of activity aimed at addressing the under-representation of women in STEM sectors. Actions will enable women studying towards and working in these key sectors to enter, develop and progress in their STEM career.

“There are so many career options within engineering and placements allow you to try different things”

Oana Sala, 3rd Year University of Glasgow on Careerwise placement with CH2M Hill.

However such improvements, while welcome, are only incremental and not consistent across all STEM subjects, we therefore need to continue to do more.

We recognise that we also need to encourage more young men to study care, health and well-being subjects at college and university by challenging stereotypes and highlighting possible career paths and advantages to studying such subject areas. We will be looking for institutions and the SFC to consider this within their action plans and for this to be reflected within implementation of the 15 – 24 Learner Journey Review’s⁴⁷ recommendations relating to careers, information, advice and guidance.

Work to address occupational segregation by gender is being undertaken across some parts of the further and higher education sector. To achieve this within the higher education sector frameworks such as Aurora and Athena SWAN are being used and there are examples in institutional Gender Action Plans of further pro-active and creative measures to support women’s progression into more senior roles, for example targeted mentoring, women-only development events around promotions rounds, and reviews of promotions criteria. The level of consistency and impact across the whole sector is however, not year clear. We would therefore urge institutions, in consultation with the relevant trade unions, to carefully consider the recommendations contained with the Universities and Colleges Employers Association report⁴⁸ into intersectional gender and ethnic gaps in higher education.

46 http://www.rse.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2018/11/Women-in-STEM-report-2018_final.pdf

47 <https://www2.gov.scot/Resource/0053/00535273.pdf>

48 http://downloads2.dodsmonitoring.com/downloads/Misc_Files/caught_at_the_crossroads.pdf

Overall minority ethnic women tend to attain higher levels of education than white women, however they are less likely to be offered university places than white women⁴⁹. Evidence in research also highlights experiences of discrimination and racist behaviour while at university, for example assumptions made around career aspirations, shaped by racial and gender stereotypes.

Other issues within the further and higher education sector include the continued need to improve the gender balance within College Boards⁵⁰, the lack of transparency around senior pay in the higher education sector and a range of gendered barriers which prevent female academics, particularly black female academics⁵¹ from progressing with their careers. Research has highlighted the need for University and College Union (UCU) and higher education institutions, to provide dedicated support for black female academics, establishing clear and transparent progression criteria on the steps towards obtaining a professorship, and commissioning research into alternative routes to heads of department and into how line managers approving professorship applications. It also calls for UCU to establish a culture of no tolerance to bullying that speaks to both explicit and more subtle forms of harassment.

We are determined that our university and college campuses should be safe places for students and staff to live, work and study free from sexual harassment and gender-based violence.

In April 2018 the Scottish Government launched the Equally Safe in Higher Education Took Kit which provides resources for institutions to tackle gender-based violence. All institutions in Scotland are expected to adopt the Tool Kit and factor a gendered analysis into their approach to this issue. Our Letter of Guidance to the SFC requires that institutions assess their own policies and practices against the Toolkit and use this to make improvements.

Research undertaken into the role of women in farming and the agriculture sector in Scotland highlighted the particular barriers faced by women in rural areas to accessing appropriate and accessible training opportunities⁵².

Whilst research so far has mainly focused on women in agriculture, the need to address these barriers in all sectors of the rural economy was a recurring issue highlighted during the discussion at the Scottish Rural Parliament held in November 2018.

49 Johnson, A., Uygun F., & Dhanda, R. (2007) The Presence, Performance and Subsequent Work/Career Path of Visible Ethnic Minority Women in Higher and/or Further Education

50 <http://audit-scotland.gov.uk/report/scotlands-colleges-2018>

51 <https://www.gold.ac.uk/news/professors-study/>

52 <https://www.gov.scot/publications/women-farming-agriculture-sector/pages/2/>

We will in 2019–20 and beyond

- Publish a Future Skills Action Plan (FSAP) which will set out our strategic response and approach to ensuring Scotland has a skilled and productive workforce, both now and in the future. In implementing the plan, we will address gender-specific issues in the labour market, to ensure that the specific inequalities and barriers women face are addressed in the future.
- Ask the SFC to work with the colleges, universities and the relevant trade unions to address both horizontal and vertical occupational segregation in their workforce, in line with their Public Sector Duties, with the aim of supporting women, including those with other protected characteristics, to progress into more senior roles.
- Work with the College Development Network to identify opportunities to increase gender equality, including intersectionality, awareness in the training programme they run for board and staff members.
- Work with the SFC to learn from the development and publication of institutional Gender Action Plans and identify good practice and areas for improvement to inform the next phase of work to address gender inequality, particularly that faced by women with other protected characteristics.
- Work with institutions, SFC and research funders to promote flexible working as standard practice (including working with UK counterparts and bodies, where required, to influence practice in the UK HE sector), ensuring that flexibility is consistently available and widely promoted to all staff, including those in research positions.
- Work with SDS and Scottish Apprenticeship Advisory Board to realise the outcomes of the forthcoming Commission into occupational segregation by gender within Apprenticeships.
- Build on and improve the range of gender-disaggregated data used to develop skills planning policy, and ensure that the new skills planning and provision model addresses occupational segregation, and the under-utilisation of women's skills as a central aim.
- Ensure closing the gender pay gap is prominent in the development of a Performance Framework for the Enterprise and Skills Strategic Board.
- Explore the opportunity to access intersectional gender-disaggregated data on employee beneficiaries of the Flexible Workforce Development Fund, including sectoral information and the type of training accessed. This will inform future policy development with the aim of addressing occupational segregation in future rounds.



Chapter 6 **EMPLOYABILITY**

Since the concentrated impact of the 2008 financial crisis on young people, the Scottish Government has prioritised education and our on going commitment to developing young people who have the right skills and qualifications needed to succeed in the labour market, through our Developing the Young Workforce Strategy⁵³. We were delighted in 2017, through our partnership working with COSLA that we were able to report the achievement of the programme's headline target, to reduce youth unemployment by 40 per cent by 2020⁵⁴.

What we are doing

However while it is still imperative that we continue to improve the positive destinations of Scotland's young people into employment, we also need to make sure that we are tackling any barriers which are preventing women from participating in employability programmes and employment, including specific barriers faced by women with other protected characteristics. It is essential that our employability programmes focus

on that, and that they do not reinforce any of the causes of the gender pay gap, such as occupational segregation.

In March 2018, we published No One Left Behind: Next Steps for the Integrated and Alignment of Employability Services in Scotland⁵⁵. This Plan laid out the steps we and our partners, including local government, NHS Scotland and SDS, will take to deliver more effective and joined-up employability support across Scotland. As part of this work

53 <https://www.gov.scot/publications/developing-young-workforce-scotlands-youth-employment-strategy/>

54 <https://www.gov.scot/binaries/content/documents/govscot/publications/report/2018/01/developing-young-workforce-scotlands-youth-employment-strategy-third-annual-progress/documents/00530056-pdf/00530056-pdf/govscot:document/>

55 <https://www.gov.scot/publications/one-left-behind-next-steps-integration-alignment-employability-support-scotland/>

we will be developing and introducing a collectively agreed national outcomes and measurement framework that enables front lines service providers – public, private and third sector – to align their activity and deliver more flexible services to the people that need them the most. In doing so we are currently developing the thinking on how women, especially those with other protected characteristics, who rely on these services can influence how they are developed and delivered.

Scotland has an opportunity to develop a system that focuses on the needs of the individual, to give them the right support when finding employment. The Scottish Government has shown its commitment to this belief with the roll-out of Fair Start Scotland from April 2018, which focuses on breaking down barriers to employment for people who are further removed from the labour market. That is why we have been, and will continue to work at a local, regional and national level to improve the join up in services and other provision focussing on health, housing and justice.

We will in 2019 and going forward:

- Design programmes of employment support for individuals and parents, including the range of new employment support activities announced in the Tackling Child Poverty Delivery Plan, to challenge occupational segregation and improve women's quality of employment, pay and progression.
- Ensure that the process for designing the new £12 million programme of employment support for parents and other future employability programmes is gender-sensitive, and that the new programme explicitly meets women's distinct needs. The programme will focus on the needs of the priority families identified in the Tackling Child Poverty Delivery Plan and we can expect disabled women, minority ethnic women, single parents, women living in larger families, women with young children and young mothers to benefit. The programme will also focus on women who have experienced domestic abuse.
- Ensure a gender-sensitive approach, as described above, to developing the specific programme of support for disabled parents, the £6 million pilot programme announced in A Fairer Scotland for Disabled People: Employment Action Plan. This will test approaches for supporting disabled parents towards and into work in areas with high levels of child poverty and low levels of disability employment.
- Building upon and improving the collection of data being published by Scotland's new devolved employment services, the Scottish Government will gather and publish gender-disaggregated data on wider employability delivery in Scotland, including around gendered needs of service users such as their care and childcare roles. As part of this there will be consideration given to, where possible, publishing analysis of experience of domestic abuse amongst service users.
- Require successful bidder(s) for delivery of employment support for parents and of future employability programme to demonstrate their current knowledge and skills around intersectional gender analysis and gender sensitive service development and or their detailed plan for further developing that capacity.



Chapter 7 **SOCIAL SECURITY**

Women are twice as dependent on social security as men and have less access to resources, assets and occupational pensions. This is due to a number of factors including women being more likely to give up work to care and earning less than men, and challenges in accessing childcare. This situation is even more acute in households where women experience domestic abuse.

What we are doing

Responding to the UK Government's social security reform, the UK Women's budget Group provided an assessment highlighting the disproportionate negative impact of this reform on women. This has resulted in women being placed at a greater risk of deeper and sustained poverty. The driver for the reform has been austerity and it has not taken gender equality into account. That is why gender runs so heavily through our Tackling Child Poverty Delivery Plan.

The design of a social security system can effect the gender pay gap in a number of ways. It can equalise access to income or exacerbate inequalities. It can act to enable women to access re-training or fully and equally participate in the labour market. It can force women to take employment which is detrimental to their well-being and long term earning potential.

In response we outlined in our Fairer Scotland Action Plan⁵⁶, Tackling Child Poverty Delivery Plan and Equally Safe Delivery Plan how we will seek to mitigate the UK Government's 'social security reform' founded on the basis of dignity, respect and human rights and to make the system fairer where we can.

However we recognise that we must continue to consider how best we ensure that gender equality is taken into account within our social security system.

In 2019 and beyond we will:

- Incorporate women's equality into the Social Security Charter, to animate the principle of equality and non-discrimination on the face of the Social Security (Scotland) Act and work with equality groups on the development of this Charter.
- Ensure that regulations for specific entitlements, including our new income supplements, are robustly gender impact assessed, and that their cumulative impact on women's equality is also impact assessed.
- Ensure that Social Security Scotland, as well as delivering the benefits service, will sign post women to advice on their maternity and workplace rights and to other relevant rights and services.
- Identify where UK Government social security reform is depleting women's capacity to participate in higher and further education, and in a fair and sustainable labour market. Longer term following this we will consider what programmes and interventions need to be developed, taking into account the diverse needs of all women, in response.

56 <https://www.gov.scot/publications/fairer-scotland-action-plan/>



Chapter 8 **ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT**

The Scottish Government approach to economic development is very much rooted in delivering inclusive economic growth. Our progressive approach is built upon growing evidence that economic inequality is itself a drag on growth. The gender pay gap is a clear and long-standing example of this. If we fail to address the gender pay gap within our economic policy making we will also fail to realise optimal economic returns.

What we are doing

We are committed to ensuring that all of our people can reap the benefits of enterprise because we recognise that this will make for stronger and more sustainable growth. Some research points to women having lower expectations when it comes to growing businesses. It is thought that this is due to women's lower level of confidence in starting businesses⁵⁷. Self-confidence is not an individualised problem however, but a culmination of societal attitudes that results in lower female

entrepreneurship rates⁵⁸. These attitudes are shaped by a number of elements including gendered entrepreneurial spaces and male-dominated networks, women starting businesses with lower levels of capital and a number of other factors identified within this Plan.

That a gender-gap exists in enterprise is not in question. That is why the Women in Enterprise Action Framework⁵⁹ was launched in 2014 and refreshed in 2017 with the aim to deliver lasting positive change working with partners from all sectors. This action plan sits alongside

57 Hunter Centre for Entrepreneurship's 'Growing Women Entrepreneurship' Research Seminar (slides on Huddle)

58 Santos, F.J., Roomi, M.A., Liñán, F. (2016) 'About Gender Differences and the Social Environment in the Development of Entrepreneurial Intentions'. *Journal of Small Business Management*, 54(1), 49-66.

59 <https://www.wescotland.co.uk/framework>

this Framework. The agenda is currently being led by the Women in Enterprise Action Group, chaired by the Minister for Business, Fair Work and Skills.

The City Region and Growth Deals in Scotland are about making step changing investments. The recently agreed Deals specifically identify activities and support to tackle the gender pay gap within their regions. For example, the Scottish Government has invested £25 million for a Regional Employability and Skills programme within the Edinburgh and South East Scotland Regional Deal. This programme will involve supporting women into higher paid jobs and assisting women to return to work after a career break. Women will also be targeted for advanced skills and training opportunities, and there will also be increased engagement with employers in the region to raise their awareness and develop support for this target group. Regional partners will ensure that any evaluation of the Deal considers how effectively the Programme has been in reducing the gender pay gap.

As part of the City Region and Growth Deals, a number of local and regional partners are also undertaking inclusive growth diagnostics to understand their priorities for driving long-term transformational change and achieving inclusive and sustainable economic growth in the economy. This process includes identifying and focusing on the groups most excluded from the benefits of growth – the North Ayrshire diagnostic, for example, particularly focused on female labour market outcomes.

According to some research across the UK, some 30% of women⁶⁰ have no access to a car particularly during the working day because either they cannot afford one or the family car is used by their partner for work. This can mean that a journey to work via school or childcare drop-off might involve several changes and a long commuting time. In Scotland, while men and women are almost equally likely to drive to work, we know that more women are more likely to travel by bus to work than men⁶¹. It has been argued by some UK researchers that some public transport timetables are designed for the ‘male’ working day rather than recognising part-time and flexible worker needs and that this can lead to women seeking work to choose a more local, lower paid, job. Although this problem can occur in major cities, it is even more apparent in rural areas. Indeed these challenges were raised at the 2018 Scottish Rural Parliament. We therefore acknowledge that more research into the transport needs of carers is required.

Within social care services, the workforce comprises nearly 8% of all employment in Scotland, with the adult social care alone employing 143,600 staff in 2017 (Scottish Social Service Sector: Report on 2017 Workforce Data) and estimated to contribute £3.4 billion in direct, indirect and induced value to the Scottish economy in 2016. The workforce is predominantly female, for example in care at home and housing support there are 82% female/18% male staff while a similar split exists in care homes for adults (85% of female).

60 <http://www.fairplaysouthwest.org.uk/manifesto/261-the-gender-pay-gap-and-how-to-eliminate-it>

61 <https://scotland.shinyapps.io/sg-equality-evidence-finder/>

The Fair Work Convention Social Care Working Group was established to look at the extent to which the fair work agenda is being realised in the social care sector. The sector is recognised as having significant strengths and elements of best practice but at the same time the Convention identified challenges to Fair Work being experienced by many frontline staff in the sector. The Fair Work Convention published⁶² their report on 26 February 2019 which makes five recommendations including for the Scottish Government to support the creation of a new sector body that establishes minimum standards for fair work terms and conditions and to reform social care commissioning.

While the Scottish Government has made important commitments to a gender-focussed economic analysis this is only a start. As we take forward this action plan, gender will be increasingly be at the heart of economic policy making and economic development operations.

In 2019 and beyond we will:

- Develop an approach to treat investment in childcare and social care as economic infrastructure.
- Ask the Enterprise and Skills Strategic Board and the boards of the enterprise and skills agencies to make gender and the gender pay gap a central mainstream part of their work.
- Undertake research into how transport infrastructure investment impacts on the gender pay gap in transport appraisal; this will then be incorporated into Scottish Transport Appraisal Guidance (STAG).
- Ensure that the gender pay gap is included in work on the new Scottish National Investment Bank's Equality Impact Assessment. This will take full account of research, learning and engagement with WiSE Centre for Economic Justice and other relevant stakeholders. This will ensure the Bank's intended leadership role with regards to diversity and inclusiveness in its governance, operational arrangements and its Investment Strategy is fully embedded.
- As outlined in the Fair Work Action Plan – work with the Fair Work Convention to help embed fair work practices in the health and social care sector. This will be informed by the Fair Work Convention's Social Care Inquiry Report.
- Given the importance of automation and artificial intelligence to the economy and labour market going forward, we will ensure that closing the gender pay gap and its causes are central to all relevant policy analysis in this area.

62 <https://www.fairworkconvention.scot/our-report-on-fair-work-in-social-care/>

Annex A

REFERENCES

There are a number of policy frameworks which are contributing to tackling the gender pay gap. These include:

Early years and childcare

Policy framework	Commitment
Fairer Scotland Action Plan	“By 2020, entitlement to free early learning and childcare will almost double for all three and four-year olds, as well as those two-year olds that stand to benefit most, to 1,140 hours per year (from current levels of 600 hours per year).”
	“In 2017-18, we will pilot approaches, in locations throughout Scotland, to reducing upfront childcare costs.”

A Blueprint for 2020: The expansion of early learning and childcare in Scotland action plan	“Work with local authorities and delivery partners to develop recruitment and career pathways which assist in both attracting and retaining high calibre candidates within the ELC workforce, and which also improve the gender balance across the sector.”
	“Work with delivery partners, who already have excellent links to communities across Scotland, to raise the profile of a career in ELC amongst underrepresented groups.”
	“Implement a programme of pilot approaches in 2017-18 to explore how additional support can be tailored to help reduce the burden of upfront childcare costs. The pilots will focus on trialling deposit guarantee schemes.”
	“Provide sufficient additional revenue funding to allow local authorities to agree rates with funded providers in the private and third sectors that enable them to pay the Living Wage to care workers providing the funded entitlement.”
A Blueprint for 2020: The expansion of early learning and childcare in Scotland: Quality action plan	“Prepare a national induction resource for all staff who are new to delivering early learning and childcare to ensure that they are well supported in developing the skills and understanding they need in their role.”
	“Develop guidance that will support local authorities and early learning and childcare providers in the private and third sectors to implement the living wage commitment.”
Tackling Child Poverty Delivery Plan	“New support for childcare after school and in the holidays.”
STEM education and training strategy	“Introduce new measures to tackle inequality and inequity, including gender stereotypes, in STEM learning and careers from the early years onwards.”
	“Work with early learning providers and schools from June 2018 to help them recognise and address unconscious bias and gender stereotyping and tackle inequity.”

Equally Safe Delivery Plan	<p>“Develop a resource for early learning and childcare practitioners on promoting gender equality.”</p> <p>“Work with early learning providers and schools to help them recognise and address unconscious bias and gender stereotyping, including steps to embed good practice from the successful Institute of Physics Improving Gender Balance project across all schools.”</p> <p>“Take forward a transformative programme to expand free Early Learning and Childcare entitlement to 1,140 hours per year by 2020, including piloting a deposit guarantee scheme for childcare places.”</p> <p>“Increase the flexibility of how this funded entitlement is delivered in order to support more parents to work, train or study, especially those who need routes into sustainable employment and out of poverty.”</p> <p>“Deliver a Returner’s Programme to assist women to re-enter the workforce following a career break – funding projects which address the under-representation of women in STEM, increase business start-up rates for women and the number of women in senior positions and encourage men into childcare to help to change the perception of caring as ‘women’s work’.”</p>
Early Learning and Childcare Service Model for 2020: Consultation paper	<p>“All providers should describe how they will commit to fair work practices for workers engaged in the delivery of the funded ELC entitlement in their setting. In addition to committing to payment of the real living wage, all settings will be able to demonstrate at least one of the following [six practices] including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A fair and equal pay policy across their setting. • Promoting equality of opportunity and developing a workforce which reflects the population of Scotland. • Avoiding exploitative employment practices such as ... pregnancy and maternity discrimination. • Consideration of patterns of working and support for family friendly working and wider work life balance.”

Early Learning and Childcare Workforce Delivery Plan 2018	“We will explore the ability to track and monitor indicators in the ELC workforce, recognising the difficulties with current data sources.”
	“We will establish links with disability networks and ethnic minority groups to identify the barriers to ELC employment for specific groups and address those barriers.”
	“We will collate and actively promote advice/sources of funding/external support/best practice examples on diversifying workforce for ELC employers. We will share widely as a standalone document.”
	“We will address those barriers via our recruitment campaign and by working with stakeholders to ensure employers are fully supported in increasing diversity in the workforce.”
Skills Investment Plan for Scotland’s Early Learning and Childcare Sector	“Deliver a high profile recruitment campaign to attract a diverse workforce.”
	“Promote the sector and create opportunities for under-represented groups.”

SCHOOL

Policy framework	Commitment
Developing the Young Workforce: Scotland’s youth employment strategy	“Scotland should embed equality education across Curriculum for Excellence.”
	“Promotion and communication of career options should actively target equalities groups to promote diverse participation across gender, Black and Minority Ethnic groups, young people with disabilities and care leavers. The promotion of Modern Apprenticeship opportunities should be to the fore of this activity.”
Career Education Standard (3-18)	“All involved in career education should provide advice, guidance and opportunities that contribute to eradicating discrimination; and promoting mutual respect and equality of opportunity across genders, social background, disabilities, ethnicities, sexual orientation and religions.”

Developing the Young Workforce: Work Placements Standard	“All stakeholders involved in any work placement should provide advice, guidance and opportunities that contribute to eradicating discrimination; and promoting mutual respect and equality of opportunity across genders, social background, disabilities, ethnicities, sexual orientation and religions.”
Delivering Excellence and Equity in Scotland	“We will work with the General Teaching Council for Scotland to provide more support to teachers on equality issues through Career Long Professional Learning to be in place by August 2017.”
Education: A delivery plan for Scotland	“We will work with Education Scotland and the General Teaching Council for Scotland to undertake a review of Initial Teacher Education programmes to report by April 2017, to ensure that they provide appropriate detail on content for literacy, numeracy, health and wellbeing, data literacy and equality across both primary and secondary sectors.”
	“We will continue to address wider issues such as gender to ensure that we are creating the conditions for all children and young people in Scotland to flourish and thrive.”
STEM Education and Training Strategy	“Introduce new measures to tackle inequality and inequity, including gender stereotypes, in STEM learning and careers from the early years onwards.”
	“Skills Development Scotland will continue to develop its approach to support key influencers (teachers, parents, career advisors and peers) to challenge assumptions of traditional career choices and encourage under-represented groups to take up STEM apprenticeship opportunities. This will include embedding equality considerations in the quality assurance of apprenticeships provision.”
	“We will seek to embed good practice from the successful Institute of Physics Improving Gender Balance project across all schools by 2022. We will create a dedicated resource to lead, manage and support this work and will involve equalities experts in the third sector.”
	“Skills Development Scotland will work with partners at a local level to increase female uptake of Foundation Apprenticeship STEM-related programmes, starting in 2018 and continuing until 2022.”

Equally Safe Delivery Plan	“Expand the delivery of the Rape Crisis Sexual Violence Prevention Programme in schools, to increase understanding of consent and healthy relationships.”
	“Through a review of Personal and Social Education, investigate how consent is taught within early years, primary and secondary schools.”
	“Pilot the development of a ‘whole school’ approach to tackling gender-based violence.”
	“Through the Developing the Young Workforce programme, develop a holistic approach towards addressing gender stereotypes and norms in schools and education settings.”
	“Provide more support for teachers on equality issues, including through the development of an online resource on relationships, sexual health and parenthood information for teachers and youth workers.”
	“Following publication of the refreshed approach to addressing bullying in schools (including bullying based on sexism and gender), develop guidance for monitoring and recording incidents.”
	“Promote prevention programmes within the wider context of positive relationships and behaviour in schools, and encourage the harmonisation of prevention approaches across local authorities.”
Modern Apprenticeship Equalities Action plan	“Build regionally co-ordinated school interventions to effect long-term cultural change with a particular focus on challenging gender stereotypes in STEM subject areas through the Improving Gender Balance (IGB) Scotland Project.”

POST-SCHOOL

Policy framework	Commitment
Developing the Young Workforce: Scotland's youth employment strategy	"Reduce to 60%, the percentage of MA frameworks where the gender balance is 75:25 or worse by 2021."
	"Increase by five percentage points the minority gender share in each of the 10 largest and most imbalanced superclasses by 2021."
	"Promotion and communication of career options should actively target equalities groups to promote diverse participation across gender, Black and Minority Ethnic groups, young people with disabilities and care leavers. The promotion of Modern Apprenticeship opportunities should be to the fore of this activity."
	"Senior phase vocational pathways should be designed to encourage more gender balance across occupations."
	"The Scottish Funding Council and colleges should develop an action plan to address gender disparities within college education. This should be underpinned by realistic but stretching improvement targets. The Scottish Funding Council should report on this annually."
	"Skills Development Scotland should develop an action plan to address gender disparities within Modern Apprenticeships. This should be underpinned by realistic but stretching improvement targets. SDS should report on this annually."

<p>Scottish Funding Council Gender Action Plan</p>	<p>Strategic aims include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “To enhance strategic oversight of tackling gender imbalances at a national, regional and institutional level. • To engage with schools to tackle gender imbalance earlier and to tackle gender stereotypes. • To enhance support for those involved in student educational processes to enable them to impact on gender imbalances. • To enhance student involvement to tackle gender imbalances. • To enhance retention and completion at a subject level where there is a gap by gender.” <p>“By 2021, increase by five percentage points the minority share in each of the 10 largest and most imbalanced ‘superclasses’ among 16-24-year olds.”</p> <p>“By 2030, no subject has an extreme gender imbalance (75:25).”</p>
<p>STEM Education and Training Strategy</p>	<p>“Introduce new measures to tackle inequality and inequity, including gender stereotypes, in STEM learning and careers from the early years onwards.”</p> <p>“Skills Development Scotland will continue to develop its approach to support key influencers (teachers, parents, career advisors and peers) to challenge assumptions of traditional career choices and encourage under-represented groups to take up STEM apprenticeship opportunities. This will include embedding equality considerations in the quality assurance of apprenticeships provision.”</p>
<p>Equally Safe Delivery Plan</p>	<p>“Through the Developing the Young Workforce programme, develop a holistic approach towards addressing gender stereotypes and norms in schools and education settings.”</p> <p>“Work with universities and colleges to ensure the provision of a safe environment for students and staff through learning and on campus action, utilising learning from existing practice, relevant recommendations for improvement, and learning from the ‘Equally Safe in Higher Education’ project.”</p>

The 15-24 Learner Journey Review	“With regard to colleges and universities ... this includes expectations for developing an effective, strategic and collaborative approach to preventing gender-based violence on campuses.”
	“We will ensure learners in schools, colleges and universities receive a joined-up approach to careers, information, advice and guidance. This work will start in 2018. We will work in partnership with colleges to ensure greater consistency in CIAG service delivery to learners. This will include better access to specific career practitioners in the college sector. We will work with QAA (Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education) and Universities to ensure their quality processes align with Scottish Government aspirations for learner access to CIAG support.”
Modern Apprenticeship equalities action plan	“Build regionally co-ordinated school interventions to effect long-term cultural change with a particular focus on challenging gender stereotypes in STEM subject areas through the Improving Gender Balance (IGB) Scotland Project.”
Skills for Scotland: Accelerating the recovery and increasing sustainable economic growth	“Promote equality of opportunity to those who face persistent disadvantage and to improve the numbers of people economically active across all groups within society.”

EMPLOYABILITY

Policy framework	Commitment
The Tackling Child Poverty Delivery Plan 2018-22	<p>“£12 million investment in new, intensive employment support for parents.”</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Deliver key worker support to our priority families, using a flexible and ‘whole person’ tailored approach.
Equally Safe delivery plan	“Ensure the successful bidder(s) to deliver devolved employment services demonstrate clearly how they will deliver a service that is gendered in terms of understanding the needs of women seeking employment; and use levers at their disposal to encourage employers to consider flexible working approaches which enable more women to take up a broader range of opportunities.”

EMPLOYMENT

Policy framework	Commitment
<p>Programme for Government 2018</p>	<p>“Introduce fair work criteria, including, paying the Living Wage, excluding exploitative zero hours contracts and being transparent on gender-equal pay to business support grants through Regional Selective Assistance and other large Scottish Enterprise job-related grants, starting with grants offered in 2019-2020.”</p>
	<p>“Implement the Gender Representation on Public Boards (Scotland) Act 2018, and provide guidance on the new requirements.”</p>
	<p>“Invest an additional £5 million over the next three years to support around 2,000 women’s return to work.”</p>
	<p>“Work with business organisations to showcase the positive contributions of women returning to work and address skills gaps in businesses across Scotland.”</p>
	<p>“Seek to offer pre-employment support to women in their local area before they undertake a three-month placement with an employer.”</p>
	<p>“Encourage women to return into more advanced roles where we know the gender pay gap is the widest.”</p>
	<p>“Work with training providers and employers to support women returning to the workforce to undertake roles in male-dominated sectors.”</p>
	<p>“Launching a major national campaign in spring 2019 to challenge sexual harassment and sexism.”</p>
	<p>“Pilot an accreditation scheme for employers which will support employers to tackle gender-based violence in their workforces.”</p>

Labour Market Strategy	<p>“We will be innovative in supporting those facing barriers in the workplace through initiatives such as a project to help women returners back into the workplace.”</p>
	<p>“Our approach will include ... continuing to tackle inequalities around pay gaps and occupational segregation in the labour market for women and for other equality groups.”</p>
	<p>“Establish a Returner’s Project focused so that women can get help updating skills and knowledge, and employers can retain skilled staff after a career break.”</p>
STEM Education and Training Strategy	<p>“Introduce new measures to tackle inequality and inequity, including gender stereotypes, in STEM learning and careers from the early years onwards.”</p>
	<p>“Skills Development Scotland will continue to develop its approach to support key influencers (teachers, parents, career advisors and peers) to challenge assumptions of traditional career choices and encourage under-represented groups to take up STEM apprenticeship opportunities. This will include embedding equality considerations in the quality assurance of apprenticeships provision.”</p>
Equally Safe Delivery Plan	<p>“Work with universities and colleges to ensure the provision of a safe environment for students and staff through learning and on campus action, utilising learning from existing practice, relevant recommendations for improvement, and learning from the ‘Equally Safe in Higher Education’ project.”</p>
	<p>“Encourage employers to put in place robust processes to deal with instances of sexual harassment.”</p>
	<p>“Develop a pilot Equally Safe employer accreditation programme in order to lever better employment practice in tackling gender-based violence experienced by the workforce.”</p>
Scotland’s Economic Strategy	<p>“Continue funding for a range of organisations to tackle the pay gap, address occupational segregation in science, technology, engineering and mathematics (STEM) areas and to work with employers to promote and support flexible working.”</p>

Fair Work Framework	<p>“By 2025, people in Scotland will have a world-leading working life where fair work drives success, wellbeing and prosperity for individuals, businesses, organisations and society. The Fair Work Framework sets out what is meant by fair work, why it is important, who can play a part in making Scotland a world-leading nation in fair work and how this might be achieved.”</p>
---------------------	---

SOCIAL SECURITY

Policy framework	Commitment
Fairer Scotland Action Plan	“We will make social security fairer when we can.”
	<p>“We will do more to help carers as soon as we have the ability”.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increase Carer’s Allowance for people who care for more than one disabled child. • Considering introducing a Young Carer’s Allowance.
	“We will work with a range of partners to help people claim the benefits they are entitled to.”
	“We will create a new Best Start Grant (BSG).”
	“By 2020, entitlement to free early learning and childcare will almost double.”
	“From April 2017, our proposed reforms will make the current Council Tax system fairer for low income families.”
Tackling Child Poverty Delivery Plan	“A new minimum payment for the School Clothing Grant across Scotland.”
	“£1 million on new practical support for children experiencing food insecurity during school holidays.”
	“New support for childcare after school and in the holidays.”
	“A new income supplement, which in time will provide vital financial support for parents on low incomes.”
	“A new Best Start Grant.”

Equally Safe delivery plan	“Develop proposals for delivering split payments under Universal Credit, working with stakeholders to explore potential policy options.”
	“Continue to set out strong opposition to the UK Government’s policy of restricting benefits to two children and the subsequent requirement on women to disclose they have been raped to access further benefits.”
	“Develop guidance for professionals who may be asked to act as third party assessors for the exemption where a child is conceived through rape, to ensure that women seeking such an assessment receive the right support.”

Annex B

WORKING GROUP MEMBERS

Membership of the Gender Pay Gap Working Group

The membership of the working group included:

- Jamie Hepburn, Minister for Business, Fair Work and Skills (Chair)
- Anna Ritchie Allan, Close the Gap
- Helen Miller, Equality & Human Rights Commission
- Emma Ritch, Engender
- Talat Yaqoob, Equate Scotland
- Dr. Ima Jackson, Glasgow Refugee Asylum and Migration Network/Glasgow Caledonian University
- Emily Thomson, WiSE Research Centre, Glasgow Caledonian University
- Prof. Patricia Findlay, Strathclyde University/Fair Work Convention
- Francis Stuart, STUC
- Scottish Government officials from the Equality Unit, Communities Analysis Division, Labour Market Statistics Team, and Workforce Equality Team.



Scottish Government
Riaghaltas na h-Alba
gov.scot

© Crown copyright 2019

OGL

This publication is licensed under the terms of the Open Government Licence v3.0 except where otherwise stated. To view this licence, visit nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/version/3 or write to the Information Policy Team, The National Archives, Kew, London TW9 4DU, or email: psi@nationalarchives.gsi.gov.uk

Where we have identified any third party copyright information you will need to obtain permission from the copyright holders concerned.

This publication is available at www.gov.scot

Any enquiries regarding this publication should be sent to us at
The Scottish Government
St Andrew's House
Edinburgh
EH1 3DG

ISBN: 978-1-78781-611-4 (web only)

Published by The Scottish Government, March 2019

Produced for The Scottish Government by APS Group Scotland, 21 Tennant Street, Edinburgh EH6 5NA
PPDAS504466 (03/19)

W W W . G O V . S C O T