

## **Gender Pay Gap Working Group**

Tuesday 10th September 2019, 10.00 – 11.30

Minutes of the seventh meeting of the Gender Pay Gap Working Group, held at St Andrews House, Edinburgh.

### **Members Present**

Jamie Hepburn, Minister for Business, Fair Work and Skills (Chair) (JH)  
Anna Ritchie Allan, Close the Gap (ARA)  
Ima Jackson, Glasgow Caledonian University (IJ)  
Emma Ritch, Engender (ER)  
Francis Stuart, STUC (FS)  
Talat Yaqoob, Equate Scotland (TY)  
Nina Teasdale, WiSe Group (NT)

### **Scottish Government (SG) Officials**

Lorraine Lee (LL)  
Spencer Thompson (ST)  
Eileen Flanagan, Scottish Government (EF)  
Gayle Mackie, Scottish Government (GM)  
Catherine Campbell (CC) (minutes)

### **Apologies**

Emily Thomson, Glasgow Caledonian University  
Patricia Findlay, University of Strathclyde  
Chris Oswald, EHRC

### **1 Welcome and Introductions**

JH welcomed members. Noted apologies as above and welcomed Dr Nina Teasdale to the working group, who will be replacing Emily Thomson.

JH informed the group that Victoria Beattie has taken up a new post as Unit Head of Employability so will no longer be attending the working group. JH and the group thanked Victoria for her work developing the action plan.

It was noted that Chris Oswald is currently on temporary secondment to Scottish Government from EHRC. CC will contact EHRC for a new representative for the working group.

JH highlighted that as previously agreed, following the publication of the action plan the working group will now meet bi-annually.

### **2 Minutes of last meeting and matters arising**

JH provided an update on the actions agreed at the last meeting, noting that the majority of actions related to the publication of the action plan and have been completed:

- 1. Consider alternative actions to ensure that gender is included in consideration of the development of inclusive growth approaches and ensure that a commitment to including gender as a focus, is included in the action plan:* This action is being taken forward in a number of ways. Officials attend and recently presented to the SG Inclusive Growth Forum on the Gender Pay Gap Action Plan.
- 2. Link with work being undertaken by the new Inequality & Poverty Commission sub group addressing transport and poverty:* Work is being taken forward with Transport Scotland colleagues regarding the National Transport Strategy which is out for consultation.

3. Under the section 'Driving Change' in the action plan, the wording to be changed to 'Encouraging, supporting and challenging employers': We are keen that the focus of the plan is to enlist the help of employers to reduce pay gaps and to emphasise the business benefits of reducing their own gender pay gaps. In practice however, we will continue to challenge employers, for example through the Scottish Business Pledge.

4. Look again at the mapping of indicators to actions with the aim of allying these more closely and/

5. Consider the approach taken within the Equally Safe Action Plan on developing indicators as a potential model for the action plan. These actions are covered in the Draft Indicators paper.

The Minutes were approved as accurate.

### **3. Leadership**

LL provided a summary of progress towards leadership actions in the action plan, outlining the key areas of activity discussed in the paper:

- Ongoing work towards improving the intersectional gender competence of Scottish Government policy officials, including plans to provide further training on EQIAs. The work of the Ministerial Working Group to mainstream and embed fair work at senior level. The group will meet again in November 2019.
- Collaborative approach to implementing the fair work, gender pay gap, disability and race equality action plans, ensuring these are well aligned.
- Work with public bodies around tackling their own gender pay gaps. JH reiterated the plan for him to write out again to public bodies regarding their gender pay gaps. LL confirmed work delayed due to lack of staff resources given the increased detail required to repeat the exercise and responding to individual bodies previous communication.
- Launch of the Future Skills Action Plan later that day, and the commitment made to double the value of the Flexible Workforce Development Fund from £10 million to £20 million.
- EF highlighted the Equality Unit's plan to deliver training for officials on the various impact assessments and their interactions and confirmed that fair work will be an underpinning ethos. ER discussed previous exploration of an approach to undertaking assessments within 1 document, which found a consolidated approach does not work well for equalities. EF will update the group on the progress of this work.
- Concerns raised that absorbing gender into the fair work agenda may result in the work being diluted and potentially side-lined. LL advised that officials are involved in key meetings alongside fair work colleagues, ensuring gender features prominently in messaging on fair work.
- IJ highlighted the need to ensure the gender pay gap action plan and race equality action plan are aligned, and take steps to ensure race is covered explicitly in the work on gender pay gap.
- LL informed members of a new team being established to focus on race equality in employment.
- IJ asked how Recognition of Prior Learning work relates to the Future Skills Action Plan. Ongoing work on the Enterprise & Skills Review is an opportunity to ensure this is properly considered. Officials have ensured the Future Skills Action Plan includes a section addressing gender.
- ARA asked if there is scope for an additional Gender Pay Gap Champion alongside the Fair Work Champion. JH advised he is keen to address Fair Work as a package, but this could be considered.
- TY asked if there will be a reporting structure for the Fair Work Champion role. The champion will engage with the working group and attend a future meeting.
- FS asked if there is room for further development of the Fair Work First criteria. This is an ongoing piece of work and criteria will evolve over time.

#### **4. Round table group update:**

Group members provided updates:

- FS: Ongoing work with sectors working on energy and climate change in recognition these are traditionally male-dominated sectors. He welcomed further discussion with working group members on the potential for union activity. TY and FS will meet and discuss.
- TY: Upcoming research from Equate into experiences of multiple forms of discrimination in STEM. Early results show a lack of understanding of intersectionality by employers and reluctance to address issues often seen as 'too complicated'. TY will bring the research back to the working group for consideration after publication.
- IJ: Ongoing work on Recognition of Prior Learning. The project will offer a useful tool to map the skills that women migrants bring to Scotland.
- ARA: Ongoing work on a review of progress towards gender equality in DYW work stream. Evidence points to a lack of progress on gender. JH advised that Scottish Government have committed to funding the regional groups for a further 5 years.
- ARA: Close the Gap were also awarded funding to undertake work on sexual harassment. Engender will contribute around 3<sup>rd</sup> part reporting and analysis of current legal structures for reporting. Close the Gap are also working on a policy paper addressing gender and automation in Scotland.
- ER: NACWG were pleased to note the acceptance of all their recommendations in principle and questioned how SG plans to approach the commitment to 'Use it or lose it' Paternity Leave. JH reiterated the need for stakeholders to join SG in advocating for this.
- JH: Recent visit to Denmark to exchange policy approaches on gender and disability. In relation to gender pay gap work, they have not made substantial progress and despite having various measures in place such as improved childcare and generous paternity leave, their gender pay gap is similar to Scotland's.

#### **5. Draft Indicators Paper**

LL provided a short introduction to the Draft Indicators paper.

ARA proposed that working group members could contribute to the development of Indicators out with the working group meeting. This was agreed.

#### **6. Update on actions**

JH gave a short summary of progress on actions from the action plan, highlighting:

- Scotland's Future Skills Action Plan, published on 3 September.
- The Cabinet Secretary wrote to public bodies and agencies across Scotland encouraging them to adopt the terms of the Fair Work Agreement between the Scottish Government and relevant civil service trade unions, including addressing gender pay gaps. Officials continue to work with employers and other stakeholders to promote understanding of Fair Work First.
- JH wrote to the UK government in April regarding the actions under the Equality Act that are reserved. This has not received a response. Officials will follow this up with the UK government.
- Case study research into the ways that businesses can reduce their gender pay gaps, investigating the strategies they use and barriers they face to help inform policy and guide business was published in April.
- The refresh of the Scottish Business Pledge is progressing. The Minister's guidance was to make the Gender Pay Gap element mandatory for employers upon signing up.

ER discussed action 51 from the action plan, around the Social Security Charter. Equality information is not being gathered at the point of application, meaning equality data will not be linked directly to claims. Engender are concerned this will limit its use to inform ongoing policy. LL advised officials will follow this up with Social Security Scotland.

ARA asked whether the findings of the Equalities Audit referenced in the update to action 35 concerning the DYW regional groups will be published or could be shared with the working group. JH will update the working group.

ARA commented on the system of data collection to inform skills planning policy, in light of discussions around flaws in the data collection confirmed by the Skills Funding Council. Qualitative data indicates it is an effective mechanism, but quantitative information requires further development.

## **6. AOB**

There was no business raised under AOB.

## **7 Close of meeting**

JH thanked the group for their contributions and closed the meeting.

The working group will next meet on 28 February, 10 – 11.30 at Atlantic Quay, Glasgow.

## **Actions**

Action	Responsible
Contact EHRC for an alternative representative to the working group, to replace Chris Oswald	CC
Update the working group on progress towards better integration of impact assessments being undertaken by the Equality Unit	EF
Share the results of Equate's research into the experience of STEM workers experiencing multiple discrimination	TY
Set up a sub group to develop the indicators for the action plan.	LL
Officials to chase up the letter written by JH to the UK government in April.	LL
Officials to highlight Engender's concerns around collection of equality data with Social Security colleagues.	LL
Update the working group on the results of the equality audit of regional groups undertaken by DYW.	JH