

**Gender Pay Gap Working Group**  
Thursday 7<sup>th</sup> February 2019, 09.30 – 11.30

Minutes of the sixth meeting of the Gender Pay Gap Working Group, held at Atlantic Quay, Glasgow.

**Members Present**

Jamie Hepburn, Minister for Business, Fair Work and Skills (Chair) (JH)  
Anna Ritchie Allan, Close the Gap (ARA)  
Ima Jackson, Glasgow Caledonian University (IJ)  
Emma Rich, Engender (ER)  
Francis Stuart, STUC (FS)

**Scottish Government (SG) Officials**

Lorraine Lee (LL)  
Spencer Thompson (ST)  
Victoria Beattie, Scottish Government (VB)  
Eileen Flanagan, Scottish Government (EF)  
Gail Mackie, Scottish Government (GM)  
Catherine Campbell (minutes)

**Apologies**

Talat Yaqoob, Equate Scotland (TY)  
Emily Thomson, Glasgow Caledonian University (ET)  
Patricia Findlay, University of Strathclyde (PF)

**1 Welcome and Introductions**

Jamie Hepburn welcomed attendees to Atlantic Quay. Apologies were noted as above. JH also noted thanks to Helen Miller for her contributions. Helen has now left the group as she has taken up a post at Scottish government. Chris Oswald from the EHRC has been sent papers for this meeting.

JH highlighted the primary focus of the meeting would be discussion of any further changes to the Gender Pay Gap Action Plan, the draft analysis and the draft ambition statement.

**2 Minutes of last meeting and matters arising**

JH provided an update on the actions agreed at the last meeting, and summarised progress with any actions outstanding. Outstanding actions were:

1. *Consider strengthening the following recommendation Ask the Enterprise & Skills Strategic Board to ensure that measures relating the gender pay gap are prominent in the development of its performance framework:* The original wording will be retained as it is more appropriate, given that that the board is a an independent body. In practice however, the outcome will be the same.
2. *Clarify the action collaborative to advance understanding of and practice in delivering gendered inclusive growth:* VB is still working with SG colleagues on this action, considering wording to explain the work being taken forward with the Scotland Centre for Inclusive Growth (SCRIG). SCRIG is working with academic and public sector partners to drive improvements in inclusive growth outcomes by setting up communities of practice. We are exploring what these will involve with a view to including gender.
3. *Consider evaluating the first round of the Workplace Equality Fund before agreeing expansion:* This was discussed with procurement colleagues, but due to issues of timing we will not be able to do this. However there is a business to business learning event on 27<sup>th</sup> March which will inform the expansion, and we are in regular conversation with Impact Funding Partners (VAF) to learn & improve the way we manage the fund.

4. Consider an action regarding the Care Inspectorate & Education Scotland to engage with gender experts in developing the Shared Inspection Framework. Work around developing a shared framework is ongoing so this action cannot be agreed yet.

5. Clarify whether addressing gender stereotypes and occupational segregation can be included in the current review of national occupational standards for ELC:

This will be considered in the next review.

6. Consider whether further actions could be added to Early Learning & Childcare chapter, regarding the encouragement of more men into childcare employment. An action will be added to the chapter, reflecting what is already built into ELC's expansion programme in this area.

JH invited comments from the group on the update. Comments included:

- ER asked whether there might be alternative actions for the Scottish government, if the community of practice on gender and inclusive growth was not agreed. She felt that the original recommendation's purpose was to address the under-theorising of inclusive growth and to develop a shared understanding of how gender relates to inclusive growth, and wondered how this ambition could be achieved if the Scottish Centre for Inclusive Growth decides against developing a community of practice. JH confirmed that alternatives will be considered if this is the outcome, but that the gender pay gap action plan would ensure that gender is included as a focus.
- IJ and ARA asked that the above commitment be reflected in the action plan to ensure accountability.

The Minutes were approved as accurate.

### **3 Feedback from meeting with COSLA and Trilateral meeting with Maree Todd & John Swinney**

#### COSLA meeting

VB provided an update on discussions with COSLA. COSLA have requested more of a leadership role to be articulated in the action plan, and this has been reflected in the narrative. They also requested that references to education reform regarding head teachers be included, which have been added. Other changes agreed were amendments to the wording on the real living wage and the inclusion of reflections on conclusions made in the benchmarking report which is about to be published. Overall the meeting was very positive, and COSLA are considering publishing a supporting statement alongside the action plan.

ARA asked for further detail on the benchmarking report and VB confirmed that the report will include gender as one of the performance indicators. Indicators will also be broken down geographically, which will be particularly helpful

#### Trilateral meeting

JH provided a brief overview on the meeting held with Maree Todd and John Swinney regarding ELC and education. The meeting focused on actions in the action plan relating to their portfolio areas and the background to the various recommendations. The meeting was positive.

### **4 Discussion on the draft action plan, analytical annex, ambition statement , title and design**

#### Action Plan

VB highlighted changes to the action plan, including two new recommendations:

- Having consulted with academic colleagues, Transport for Scotland have concluded that there is currently insufficient evidence within available research to evidence a causality relationship between transport and gender inequality. They have suggested that the Scottish government include appraisal of the gender pay gap within transport appraisal in the Scottish Transport Appraisal Guidance (STAG) and undertake research into how transport

infrastructure investment impacts on the gender pay gap. This recommendation will be added to the action plan.

- Having met with disability colleagues, disability has been reflected more in the text of the action plan. Also, an action has been included to ensure that a gender sensitive approach is taken to the development of the £6 million pilot support for disabled parents.
- Narrative on Close the Gap's *Still Not Visible* report addressing the challenges for BME workers has been included and a hyperlink to the report will be added after publication.
- Reference to a recent report from University & Colleges Union addressing the challenges faced by Black female professors in academia will be included.

JH invited further comments from the group on the action plan. Comments included:

- ER suggested that we link with a new sub-group established by the Inequality & Poverty Commission to look at transport and poverty. ER sits on the subgroup and will provide an update.
- IJ was asked to provide comment on the transport strategy and reflected that Transport for Scotland had advised that they were not aware of specific issues for BME people around transport, prompting surprise from colleagues involved in race equality work. Transport for Scotland are now looking at this.
- FS asked whether there needed to be more included in the narrative regarding collective bargaining and social care. VB advised that there were a number of references throughout the narrative and also more will be included once the Fair Work Convention Social Care report is published. The Fair Work action plan will connect commitments to partnership working and collective bargaining and we will refer to this in the gender pay gap action plan.
- ARA queried the action urging the UK government to *protect* women, including pregnant women's rights, as those rights are already protected under current legislation. She suggested that wording could be changed to urge the UK government to *enforce* protections. JH agreed to this suggestion.
- ARA asked if where there were references to groups with protected characteristics, this could also specifically name the different groups. This was agreed.
- ER asked whether the plan could directly reference recommendations made in the recent report from the National Advisory Council on Women & Girls. VB advised that given the timing for responses to the report from the FM, this was not possible.
- Members agreed to email VB directly with any further points.

### Analytical Annex

Spencer Thompson highlighted the changes made to the analysis. He had looked primarily at references to intersectionality and has included further detail in the introductory section and throughout the narrative. Group members commented on the strengths of the analysis and thanked ST for his work on it.

### Ambition Statement

VB provided a short introduction to the draft ambition statement provided to the group and invited comments. Comments included:

- FS asked whether it would be possible to provide a specific target to the ambition to reduce the gender pay gap by 2021. The group discussed the challenges of producing a meaningful measurable target and examples from other countries. Given the complexity of the drivers of the gender pay gap and the fluctuations of the labour market, the group felt it was unrealistic to set one specific measurable target.
- FS asked if under 'Driving Change' the sentence could read '*Encouraging, supporting and challenging employers...*'
- ER highlighted the mapping between indicators and recommendations and asked if it would be possible to undertake more mapping, to ensure that those recommendations with indicators do not take undue precedence over those without. JH agreed that work will be done on this but highlighted the need to avoid excessive numbers of targets which could potentially shift the focus from overall progress.

- ER suggested that the approach taken to developing the Equally Safe indicators may be helpful as a model. Victoria will contact Scottish government colleagues to look at this.

### Title

VB presented two options for the title of the action plan: '*Fairer Scotland: The Gender Pay Gap Action Plan*' and '*Fairer Scotland for Women: Tackling the Gender Pay Gap Action Plan*'. The group preferred the second title.

### Design

The group provided comments on the initial design mock-up produced by the designer APG. Comments included:

- LL clarified that the first page titled 'Make More Possible' was a standard template used by the design company and not intended for publication. Likewise the wording on the two alternative cover pages was provided by APG and did not reflect Scottish government choices for wording.
- Regarding images, the group agreed that it is essential to ensure that photographs fully reflect diversity, and include images of disabled, older and BME women from the outset.
- EF suggested that the cover page could depict images of women across the life cycle, reflecting the scope of actions to address the gender pay gap. The group agreed this could work well.
- The group discussed the need to ensure that those working on design had a good level of gender competence. LL confirmed that she would feed this back to procurement colleagues.
- LL confirmed that these were just the initial suggestions from the design company and we would be looking more widely for appropriate photographs. Any suggested photographs that the group could provide would be welcome.

## **5. Future of the Working Group**

JH offered thanks to the group for their hard work on developing the action plan to this stage, particularly for the work undertaken between meetings and for the group's work in developing the recommendations. He suggested that from this point the group could continue to meet on an advisory basis, meeting annually ahead of the publication of the annual progress report. Crossover between this and other policy working groups that the group members attend, will ensure continued awareness of the progress of the action plan.

ARA suggested that bi-annual meetings might be more effective. JH suggested that the group meets biannually for the first 12 months following publication and annually from then. The group agreed. VB will contact members not present at the meeting to check that this is agreeable.

VB confirmed that Scottish government hopes to publish and launch the report on International Women's Day 8<sup>th</sup> March as part of a Women in Enterprise event, which the First Minister may attend. The event is not yet confirmed however, so alternative events planned for week commencing 4<sup>th</sup> April are being considered. The group will be updated when plans are confirmed.

ER asked that the group be given as much notice as possible as, given the focus of their work, International Women's Day is a very busy time.

ARA asked about the Fair Work & Gender Equality Ministerial Working Group and whether this is a new group. VB confirmed that this is an established group attended only by Ministers and officials.

## **6. AOB**

There was no business raised under AOB.

## **7 Close of meeting**

JH reiterated his thanks for the group's contributions and closed the meeting.

## Actions Agreed

### Action Plan

Action	Responsible
Consider alternative actions to ensure that gender is included in consideration of the development of inclusive growth approaches and ensure that a commitment to including gender as a focus, is included in the action plan	VB
Link with work being undertaken by the new Inequality & Poverty Commission sub group addressing transport and poverty	ER
Within the action regarding asking the UK government to protect women's, including pregnant women's rights, change wording to ask that the UK government ensure that protections are enforced	VB
Where there are references to women with protected characteristics, include specific mention of different groups e.g. BME women	VB

### Ambition Statement

Under the section Driving Change, the wording to be changed to <i>'Encouraging, supporting and <b>challenging</b> employers...'</i>	VB
Look again at the mapping of indicators to actions with the aim of allying these more closely	VB
Consider the approach taken within the Equally Safe Action Plan on developing indicators as a potential model for the action plan	VB

### Title & Design

Ensure that images used in the action plan strongly reflect diversity, including images of BME, disabled and older women	LL
For the title page, use images depicting women and girls across the life cycle, ensuring that these reflected diversity	LL
Feed back to procurement officials, the need for suppliers to have a good level of gender competence	VB
Group members to email any images they would like to suggest for inclusion in the action plan	ALL

